

# ALAN RYAN: ON POLITICS, BOOK ONE

## STUDY GUIDE, 2013-14

### Steven Alan Samson

## INTRODUCTION: THINKING ABOUT POLITICS

### Outline

- A. RELEVANCE OF GREEK FORMS TO A GLOBAL AGE (xi-xix)
1. R. W. and A. J. Carlyle, *History of Mediaeval Political Theory in the West*
  2. Question of Intellectual Unity
  3. **Herodotus**
    - a. Whether the Persians had, in the end, defeated the Greeks
      - 1) Greek view of Persia: a system of slaves
    - b. **G. W. F. Hegel** on **oriental despotism**
    - c. Persia as the prototype of the **modern nation-state**
    - d. Essence of the modern state
      - 1) Centralized bureaucracy
      - 2) Bureaucratic management
      - 3) Efficient delivery of public services
    - e. **Louis XIV**: The state as a **legal person** [Roman **corporation**] [cf. Ernest Kantorowicz's *The King's Two Bodies*; Roger Scruton's *The West and the Rest*]
    - f. Contrast between the Persian state and the Greek **polis** [city-state]
  4. Greek vs. Roman Ideas of **Freedom** and **Citizenship**
    - a. Unfiltered **direct democracy** [plebiscitary] vs. structured and controlled rule
    - b. Components of Roman freedom
      - 1) Citizen rather than slave
      - 2) Possession of a legal **status** sufficient to secure one's rights in court
      - 3) Political rights and duties graded according to financial status [Sir Henry Maine has noted the modern movement from status to contract]
  5. Extension of Roman Citizenship
    - a. **Civis sine suffragio** = citizen without vote [Jewish residents of Tarsus, a center of learning where the Apostle Paul was born, were granted Roman citizenship]
    - b. Athenian obsession with the right to speak, vote and hold office [even for a day]
    - c. **Isegoria** = equal rights in the Assembly
    - d. These differences have dominated European and American political thought since the English Civil War of the 1640s [especially the Putney Debates]
    - e. The question: How far to follow the Athenian example
  6. Superficial Understanding of Political Equality
    - a. One person, one vote
      - 1) How democracy can be undermined
      - 2) Discrepancy in political effectiveness in modern industrial societies between the organized and the unorganized
      - 3) Question whether the public can be protected against organized political interests (**Jean-Jacques Rousseau** identified the problem)
  7. Roman Arguments in Favor of Political Involvement
    - a. **Niccolò Machiavelli**'s citizen armies
    - b. Views from the Left
      - 1) Instrumental (pragmatic) arguments for **universal suffrage**
      - 2) History of trade union legislation
  8. Modern Anxiety about Popular Participation in Political Life
    - a. It focuses on the political roles of **elites and masses** [*i.e.*, status]

- b. "Masses" is a relatively modern term, but the contrast between the elite and the rank-and-file is ancient
        - 1) Critics of Athenian democracy complained of the political arts (Sophism)
        - 2) Platonic vision of the statesman as a shepherd
  - 9. Modern Thinkers Distinguish between an Adept Elite and the Incompetent Many
    - a. Rule by the Few as a reality [Vilfredo Pareto and Robert Michels]
      - 1) Totalitarian vs. democratic elites
    - b. Rule by competing elites
      - 1) **Circulation of elites** [Robert Michels]
      - 2) Open competition and free elections
    - c. Problems in the Recruitment Process
      - 1) **Primary elections** were adopted to counteract a restrictive system of recruitment, but with only partial success
  - 10. Rule by Professional Politicians
    - a. Poor results due to conflicting pressures and the near impossibility of tasks
    - b. Whether their role could be diminished and the ordinary citizen be given more work to do
  - 11. **Benjamin Constant**: Lecture on Classical vs. Modern Conceptions of Freedom
    - a. **Ancient Freedom**
      - 1) A share of sovereign authority
      - 2) Society depended on the existence of slavery and mutual surveillance
    - b. **Modern Freedom**
      - 1) Private aspect: Freedom from the political sphere [Pericles' *idiotes*]
      - 2) Liberal aspect: occupational, educational, religious freedom
      - 3) Democratic aspect: Accountability
      - 4) Contrast with people's democracies, which provide no opportunity to canvass alternatives
  - 12. Social Values of **Liberal Democracy**
    - a. **Alexis de Tocqueville**: Equality of condition
      - 1) Western world's commitment to forms of inclusiveness
      - 2) Removal of many grounds for claiming advantage
  - 13. Author's Presupposition
    - a. Project of entering the thoughts of the long dead is both possible and useful
    - b. Question of the sameness of human nature
      - 1) Author's answer: Not exactly
    - c. Reasons for his doubts on the subject: Recent transformative revolutions
      - 1) Industrial revolution [1770 onward]
      - 2) Demographic revolution [enabled by industrial and hygienic revolutions]
      - 3) Literacy and communications revolutions [cf. Marshall McLuhan]
      - 4) Political revolution [two types: 1776, 1789]
    - d. Greatly enhanced technological capacities
  - 14. Technological Advances
    - a. Global scale
      - 1) Politics of an interconnected and increasingly crowded planet
    - b. Greeks shared a rich civic life that even now we contemplate with envy
- B. THINKING ABOUT POLITICS (xx-xxv)
- 1. Political Thought or Political Theory
    - a. Little agreement on its definition, elements of which include
      - 1) History
      - 2) Sociology
      - 3) An obsession with less than two dozen books
      - 4) Eavesdropping on the Elysian Fields
  - 2. Risk of Foisting Our Views on the Unresisting Dead
    - a. **Isaiah Berlin's** essays in the history of ideas provides a model of this enterprise
    - b. R. G. Collingwood: Historical explanation is a matter of rethinking past thoughts
    - c. Berlin's ability to engage with the temperament of thinkers

3. Public Intellectuals
  - a. **Allan Bloom's** *The Closing of the American Mind*
  - b. Francis Fukuyama's *The End of History and the Last Man*
  - c. Simon Schama and Gordon Wood
  - d. **Bertrand Russell's** *History of Western Philosophy*
    - 1) His dismissiveness
  - e. John Stuart Mill's *On Liberty*
  - f. **Plato**
  - g. **Karl Marx**
4. Author's Political Enthusiasm
  - a. Skeptical about the way we talk about politics
  - b. Self-described democracies are really something else
  - c. Impossible expectations: Operation of new institutions under old labels, perhaps enabling a plutocracy to exploit a political system for its own benefit
  - d. Our self-deception: We are subjects, not citizens
  - e. Rome's **SPQR** (*Senātus Populus que Rōmānus*): military and bureaucratic dictatorship
5. Modern Politics
  - a. Advantages
    - 1) Rights
    - 2) Women and the poor
  - b. Need to know what we are praising
  - c. Comparative study
    - 1) We have acquired our political vocabulary and assumptions from Greece and Rome
6. Subject of the Book: How we human beings can govern ourselves
  - a. Assumptions
  - b. Two and a half millennia of answers form the subject of the book
  - c. More questions are raised: religious, philosophical, historical, biological, sociological
  - d. Convictions about the goal of politics
7. Book about books
8. No Substitute for the Originals
  - a. It is not a textbook, but rather a context and pretext book

## Review

Herodotus	G. W. F. Hegel	oriental despotism
modern nation-state	Louis XIV	state as a legal person (corporation)
ideas of freedom and citizenship	direct democracy	legal status
<i>civis sine suffragio</i>	<i>isegoria</i>	Jean-Jacques Rousseau
Niccolò Machiavelli	universal suffrage	elites and masses
circulation of elites (Michels)	primary elections	Benjamin Constant
ancient freedom	modern freedom	liberal democracy
Alexis de Tocqueville	Isaiah Berlin	Allan Bloom
Bertrand Russell	Plato	Karl Marx

# PART I: THE CLASSICAL CONCEPTION

## CHAPTER 1: WHY HERODOTUS?

### Outline

- A. TALKING GREEK (AND LATIN) ABOUT POLITICS (5-8)
1. Inherited Words
    - a. Shared ideals
    - b. Greek *polis*: A fragile flowering
      - 1) Origins
      - 2) Diminished self-rule under the Hellenistic and Roman empires
  2. We Describe Ourselves as the Greeks Described Themselves
    - a. Question whether their vocabulary can make sense today
      - 1) Demographic differences
      - 2) Athens as a case in point
  3. Greek Conception of Politics
    - a. Greeks contrasted themselves with the Persians
      - 1) **Politics** could only exist in a self-governing state under the **rule of law**
      - 2) Persia's great king was seen as a **master of slaves** [*despotes*], not a ruler of citizens
    - b. **Demaratus**, the ousted king of Sparta
      - 1) Greeks would fight to preserve their freedom
      - 2) Their master was law
    - c. Free citizens are self-disciplined [cf. Victor Davis Hanson, *Culture and Carnage*]
    - d. Essence of a **republic** is independence
    - e. Citizenship eventually extended to the lower classes
  4. Political Thought Began in Athens
    - a. Worldly experience of a trading people
    - b. Contrast with Israelites
      - 1) A people who had no politics [contrast two books entitled *The Hebrew Republic*, one by E. C. Wines and the other by Eric Nelson]
      - 2) Politics as a fall from grace
- B. THE BIRTH OF THE *POLIS* (8-9)
1. Obscure Origins
    - a. **Aristotle's** collection of constitutions
      - 1) Two views of how a *polis* was formed
      - 2) **Synoikismos**
    - b. First "city-states" were not always based on a city
      - 1) Sparta was a cluster of villages in which every man was a brick in the wall
  2. Division into Rich and Poor
    - a. **Eupatridae**
    - b. Tyrants
    - c. The Peisistratids
    - d. Reforms of Solon
- C. ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY (9-13)
1. Increasingly Radical Democracy
    - a. An unintended Spartan achievement
    - b. The aristocrat, **Cleisthenes**, started the process
      - a. The **Thetes**
  2. Lines of Division
    - a. Free vs. servile
    - b. No naturalization process
    - c. Athenian citizenship was by descent
    - d. Gender
      - 1) High-status women were veiled in public
    - e. Mercantile economy
  3. **Ecclesia** = Assembly
    - a. No separation of powers
      - 1) No appeal except to a later meeting of the Assembly
      - 2) **Boule**: Governing council

- 3) **Prytany**: Managing committee of the boule for a month
    - b. Members chosen by lottery
    - c. No public prosecutors
  - 4. Cleisthenes' Innovations
    - a. Finances of the fleet and army placed on a regular basis
      - 1) Revenues fell heavily on the better-off
      - 2) Silver mines
    - b. Citizens organized into ten tribes
    - c. **Demes** [villages] of Attica
    - d. Work of the boule
    - e. **Prytany** = cabinet, led by the president of the day [a position Socrates held at a critical moment in the trial of the generals]
  - 5. Ten **Stratego**i [generals]
    - a. Military leadership was meritocratic rather than democratic
    - b. **Pericles**
      - 1) **Thucydides**: "What was in name democracy, became in actuality rule by the first man"
  - 6. Pericles as Demagogue [People's Leader]
    - a. Cleisthenes' democracy
      - 1) A direct rather than a representative democracy
      - 2) It was not a liberal democracy since it lacked constitutional restrictions on the assembly and no boundaries between public and private life
      - 3) Choice by lot seen as self-evidently egalitarian [similarly, ostracism was by lot]
      - 4) Absolute sovereignty of the Assembly
- D. GLORIES AND FAILURES OF DEMOCRACY (13-18)
  - 1. Two Great Wars of the 5C BC
    - a. **Persian Wars**
    - b. **Peloponnesian War**
    - c. Athens: Chief maritime power of Greece after 479 BC
    - d. Defeat and revival of Athens
    - e. Defeats at Chaeronea (338) and Amorgos (322)
  - 2. Herodotus and Thucydides
    - a. Herodotus: Father of history and father of lies
    - b. Thucydides
    - c. Their histories are not even-handed
  - 3. Why Greeks and Persians Were Doomed to Fight Each Other
    - a. Revolt of **Miletus** and other Ionian cities of Asia Minor (500 BC)
      - 1) Reason for the revolt is obscure
      - 2) It was a revolt of the prosperous and confident
  - 4. Athenian Intervention
    - a. Inevitability issue
  - 5. Persia Crushes the Revolt, Then Turns against Athens
    - a. Abortive first invasion, 492 BC: fleet wrecked by storm [cf. kamikaze winds, 1274 and 1281; Spanish armada, 1588; French armada off New England coast, 1746]
    - b. Murder of the Persian ambassadors by Athens and Sparta
    - c. Battle of Marathon, 490
    - d. Plataea's contribution
    - e. Athenian **hubris** [overweening [pride that provides the envy of the gods]
  - 6. Xerxes
    - a. Euboea
    - b. Battle of Thermopylae
      - 1) Betrayal by Ephialtes
    - c. King Leonidas and the 300
    - d. Epitaph [cf. the Lion Monument in Lucerne]
    - e. **Demaratus**

7. Stratagem of Themistocles
  - a. Battle of Salamis
  - b. Battle of Plataea
8. Rise and Fall of the Radical Athenian Democracy
  - a. Athens cited as an object lesson [a “proverb and byword,” to use the Biblical expression] about the perils of hubris
    - 1) Imperial overreach [cf. Paul Kennedy’s *Rise and Fall of the Great Powers*]
  - b. The Delian League
  - c. Athenian Empire
    - 1) League members became tributary states
    - 2) Beautification of Athens and the subsidization of the lower classes
9. Self-Interest: Check on Athenian Conduct
  - a. Sparta was indecisive and the Athenian allies were weak
  - b. There were no constitutional provisions to ensure the good behavior of the Assembly or the council
  - c. Constitutional checks only came later
10. Practice of **Ostracism** [Another Example of Direct Democracy]
  - a. Example of Aristides the Just, who was recalled from exile after two years
- E. THUCYDIDES AND HIS HISTORY (18-20)
  1. Military Superiority of the Peloponnesian Alliance (Led by Corinth and Sparta)
  2. Athenian Ingenuity and Energy
    - a. Assembly’s habit of turning against its generals
    - b. Athens’ conduct reflected badly upon itself
  3. **Thucydides**
    - a. Dismissal and exile, 424 BC
  4. Three Striking Passages from His *History*
    - a. **Funeral Oration of Pericles** [See Steinberger, pp. 39-42]
      - 1) Counterpoint to the debates in Athens
    - b. Massacre and Enslavement of the **Melians** [See Steinberger, pp. 54-58]
    - c. Expedition against **Syracuse**
  5. Democracy and Human Rights
    - a. Athens was unequivocally democratic and frequently wicked
    - b. Historical parallel: The WWII firebombing of civilian populations
    - c. Athens vs. Syracuse: Democracies did go to war with each other
    - d. Athenian addiction to war
      - 1) Its profitability
    - e. Thucydides believed the aggressiveness of democracies was a universal trait
- F. PERICLES’S FUNERAL ORATION (20-22)
  1. Set-piece Speeches
  2. Comparison with Abraham Lincoln’s Gettysburg Address
    - a. Pep talks
  3. Athenian state funerals
    - a. Praise of the city [encomium or eulogy]
      - 1) Description of Athenian democracy as a meritocracy
  4. Liveliness of a Free and Open Society
    - a. Their own diffidence of others is enlightened
    - b. The business of the people is politics
      - 1) The ideal is participatory democracy
  5. Peroration on the Virtues of the Athenian Dead
    - a. The whole earth is the tomb of famous men
    - b. Pericles’ exhortation to women
- G. THE “MELIAN DIALOGUE” (23-25)
  1. Speeches That “Were Called for in the Situation”
    - a. Athenian demand for the surrender of **Melos**, 416 BC
    - b. “Might makes right” [The strong do as they will and the weak do as they must]

2. Ryan Contends that Melian Neutrality Was Not the Issue
  - a. Melos was a Spartan colony
  - b. Mytilene as a precedent, 427 BC [See Steinberger, pp. 47-52]
  - c. Spartan precedent: Plataea, 426 BC
3. Artful Construction of the Debate
  - a. Appeal to Athenian self-interest
  - b. Patent injustice
  - c. Capacity of democracies for mass murder should not be underestimated
4. Stalemate
  - a. Athens' survival was its victory
  - b. Spartan crudeness, corruption, unreliability
- H. ALCIBIADES AND THE SICILIAN DISASTER (25-28)
  1. Causes of the Athenian Downfall
    - a. Ambition of **Alcibiades**
      - 1) His connections
      - 2) His treachery
      - 3) His brilliance as a strategist
  2. Athenian Politics Became Unstable after Pericles: a Competition of Demagogues
    - a. Peace of **Nicias**
    - b. Sicilian Expedition, 415-413
    - c. Lamachus
    - d. Rivalry between Alcibiades and Nicias
  3. Circumstances
    - a. An unwinnable war crept upon Athens
    - b. Sicilian cities formed an alliance to resist Athens
    - c. Immense resources were dedicated to the expedition
    - d. Alcibiades learned he was sentenced to death in his absence
    - e. Lamachus killed
    - f. Nicias' wavering leadership
    - g. Athenians' surrender and sentence to be worked to death in the quarries
  4. Athenian Agony
    - a. Crash shipbuilding program
    - b. Alcibiades' role as adviser to Sparta
    - c. Oligarchical coup, 411
    - d. Alcibiades restored
    - e. Two blunders
      - 1) Athens' refusal of a Spartan peace offer
      - 2) Second refusal Arginusae
    - f. Trial and execution of generals [which included Pericles the Younger]
    - g. Spartan-Persian alliance
    - h. Lysander
    - i. Destruction of the long walls
    - j. The **Thirty Tyrants**
  5. Reasons for the War's Importance
    - a. Illustration of the strengths and weaknesses of democracy
    - b. It reveals a major reason for the **failure of the Greek states**
      - 1) Parochial attitudes
      - 2) Rivalry overcame fear of non-Greek powers [what George Washington warned against in his Farewell Address]
      - 3) Discovery of the **federal state**: The **Lykian League**
- I. THE TRIAL OF SOCRATES (28-30)
  1. Oligarchy
    - a. Critias and Theramenes
    - b. Thirty Tyrants
    - c. Execution of Theramenes
    - d. Overthrow of Thrasylbulus

- e. Restoration of democracy on a more moderate basis
- f. Trial of Socrates
- 2. Plato's Astonishing Philosophical Career
  - a. Dialogues
  - b. Socrates' death raised questions about the limits of state authority
  - c. Socrates' piety
    - 1) Homer's *Iliad*
  - d. Athenians were urbane and superstitious
- 3. The Politics behind Socrates' Trial
  - a. How he alienated his fellow-citizens
    - 1) Provocations
- 4. Socrates' Response
  - a. He refused to break the laws
  - b. Plato's vendetta

### Review

rule of law	<i>despotes</i>	Demaratus
republic	Aristotle	<i>synoikismos</i>
<i>eupatridae</i>	Cleisthenes	<i>thetes</i>
<i>ecclesia</i>	<i>boule</i>	<i>prytany</i>
<i>demes</i>	<i>stratego</i>	Pericles
Thucydides	Persian Wars	Peloponnesian War
Miletus	ostracism	Funeral Oration of Pericles
Melians	Syracuse	Melos
Alcibiades	Nicias	Thirty Tyrants
failure of the Greek states	federal state	Lykian League

## CHAPTER 2: PLATO AND ANTIPOLITICS

### Preface

This chapter has the virtue of engagingly arguing an interpretation of Plato's *Republic* which threatens to remove it from the domain of political theory altogether. The *Republic* may have pedagogical, literary, spiritual, or entertainment value, as Ryan affirms, but he contends it is essentially unpolitical or antipolitical in its overall character. Indeed, it could be described as a political vendetta against the Athenian democracy. By way of contrast, Eva Brann's Introduction to Reading the *Republic*, examines the carefully crafted literary forms in order to elicit a deep pedagogical purpose behind its construction. These two pieces are two of the most striking among a rich and varied cavalcade of interpretations.

### Outline

- A. THE PARADOXICAL PLATO (30-35)
  - 1. Plato's Political Thought Is *Antipolitical*
    - a. It is part of a utopian current of European thought
      - 1) Sir Thomas More's *Utopia*
      - 2) Ryan expects there to be no politics in the heavenly kingdom
    - b. Utopian ideal of a social order without economic or political competition
    - c. Plato: founder of European political thought *and* antipolitical thinking
      - 1) Disenchantment with Athenian democracy
      - 2) Only Plato provided an elaborate philosophical justification for giving up on politics as such [assuming this is his purpose in the *Republic*]
  - 2. *Gorgias* and the *Republic*
    - a. Modern accusations against Plato



- 1) They are too anachronistic to be taken seriously [e.g., Karl Popper's *The Open Society and Its Enemies*]
  - b. The real complaint: Plato does not take the inescapability of politics seriously
  - c. But neither did Marx and Engels
    - 1) Like the "utopian socialists" they disparaged, Marx and Engels believed coercive government would be replaced by technical management
- 3. **Aristotle: Plato Purified Politics to Death**
  - a. **Over-unification**
  - b. Influence of Plato's metaphysics
    - c. The cultural renaissance of the 12C reinvigorated classical scholarship in western Europe, especially Aristotle's *Politics*
    - d. The revival of Plato emphasized the metaphysics
    - e. The *Republic* was later regarded as a treatise on education
- 4. Comparison of Marx with Plato
  - a. Karl Marx sought to replace politics with rational organization [cf. Jürgen Habermas' *Toward a Rational Society*]
    - 1) But he looked to radical political action to accomplish this egalitarian Utopia
  - b. Plato abolished politics by philosophical fiat
    - 1) Existence of slaves and common laborers is presupposed
    - 2) The myth of the metals
- 5. Plato's *Laws*
  - a. Aristotle criticized both the *Republic* and the *Laws*
    - 1) Absence of a discussion of constitutions
    - 2) *Politeia* for Aristotle means constitutional theory
  - b. Plato's subject is the ignorance of politicians
    - 1) Lack of knowledge is regarded as more dangerous than the deadly sins
    - 2) Author's rebuttal: Alcibiades' ambition is a more obvious place to start
- 6. Socrates
  - a. Mocked by Aristophanes
  - b. Admired by Xenophon
  - c. Socrates' mission
  - d. Oracle at Delphi
- 7. Doctrines
  - a. Wickedness is error
  - b. Natural world is too difficult to think about
  - c. The invention of writing had enfeebled the intellect [cf. Walter Ong and Marshall McLuhan on the oral/aural culture]
- 8. Last Plausible Ideas Are the Closest to Socrates' Known Doctrines
  - a. Antidemocratic ideas
  - b. The oligarchy's attempted entrapment of Socrates to make him complicit in crime
  - c. His subsequent execution by the regime that saved him
- B. PLATO'S LIFE (35-38)
  - 1. Background
    - a. Critias and Charmides
    - b. **Seventh Letter**
  - 2. Judicial Murder of Socrates
    - a. **Voluntary exile** of many of his disciples
    - b. **Academy** founded in Athens, 387 BC
      - 1) Its 916 year run
      - 2) Equation of intellectual- with character-training
  - 3. Competing Schools of Rhetoric and Philosophy
    - a. **Sophists**
    - b. Socrates subverted their worldly ambitions
  - 4. Plato's Practical Interventions into Politics
    - a. Dionysius I

- b. Dionysius II
  - c. [Third attempt: Reference to Dion, Plato's student, about whom Plutarch wrote]
  - d. Martin Heidegger
  - e. Plato's life in the litigious society of Athens
  - f. His legacy: the Dialogues
5. Plato's Artistry
- a. His belief in the impact of art
  - b. Socrates may be enjoyed as a literary character
- C. **GORGIAS (38-47)**
1. Attraction of the Dialogue as a Literary Device
    - a. Plato's obsessions
  2. Three Parts of *Gorgias*
    - a. Interrogation of Gorgias
    - b. Confrontation with Polus
    - c. Rambunctious argument with Callicles
  3. Rhetoric
    - a. **Saint Augustine**
    - b. Assemblies were also law courts
    - c. **Cicero**
  4. Socrates Began the Contrary Tradition of Belittling Rhetoric
    - a. He snubbed jurors and rhetorical conventions
    - b. He claimed that his discussion of dangerous subjects in the streets was a divinely appointed duty which he must continue [cf. liberty of conscience]
    - c. Plato's complaints and Socrates' ironies reveal how speakers ingratiated themselves with their hearers
  5. Victims of Socrates' Questioning
    - a. **Polus and Callicles**
      - 1) Anticipation of **Thrasymachus** in the *Republic*
    - b. Socrates unravels **Gorgias**'s claims as a teacher
    - c. Plato evicted rhetoricians from the terrain of the philosopher
    - d. Instead, young men must learn the nature of justice
  6. Upbringing of Aristocratic Young Men
    - a. Corruption by fame
      - 1) Alcibiades
      - 2) Pericles' sons
    - b. The essential question is about proper teaching
  7. Gorgias: Socrates Wonders What Extraordinary Skills He Has for Sale
    - a. Prepping for success
    - b. Philosophy and rhetoric seem to be about nothing in particular
    - c. Subtext to the question
  8. Nature of Rhetoric
    - a. Manipulation of appearances
    - b. **Aristophanes' *The Clouds*** [see Steinberger, pp. 78-117]
      - 1) Art of bamboozling an Athenian jury acquired at the *phrontisterion* = thinkery
    - c. Plato held that rhetoric was the reverse of philosophy
      - 1) Deceptiveness of appearances makes philosophy necessary
    - d. It is either not a skill at all or it is mere pandering
    - e. Politics of flattery and deceit drives out the politics of truth
  9. The Success of Gorgias's Students Is Bad for the City and Bad for Them
    - a. They make the worse appear better [part of what Socrates rephrasing of the indictment against himself]
    - b. Prostitution of Gorgias's talents
      - 1) In a democracy everything is based on show and appearance, not truth
    - c. Gorgias sins in ignorance
    - d. Ignorance pays off in a democracy and is unlikely to be cured in it

10. Commonplace Greek View that the Unbridled Pursuit of Self-Interest Constitutes Success
  - a. Gorgias claims he has the same power as the tyrant, but through persuasion rather than coercion
  - b. Socrates dismisses this as illusion
    - 1) The only thing worth having is a just soul
  - c. Inner death of the unjust man
  - d. Polus's mockery
  - e. Socrates: Neither mockery nor majority opinion are good guides to the truth
11. Socrates' View: The Unjust Man Is Always Worse Off Than the Just Man
  - a. Polus cites successful villainy [cf. the Ring of Gyges in the *Republic*]
    - 1) Archelaus
12. Two Issues Are Central to Plato's Distaste for Conventional Politics
  - a. **Selfish motives** impel people to seek political power
    - 1) Plato assumes we would be unrestrained in gratifying our urges if we had absolute power
    - 2) Lord Acton's dictum: Power tends to corrupt; absolute power corrupts absolutely
    - 3) Oddity for the modern reader: How Polus's sympathies are unabashedly with the holder of absolute power [it seems odd because of the residue of Christian morality]
  - b. Deeper issue is philosophical
    - 1) Socrates disputes Polus's understanding of power
    - 2) Doing what you want must be distinguished from doing what is in your best interest [cf. Rousseau on the general will vs. the will of all]
    - 3) Political ambitions regarded as a sickness of the soul
    - 4) Gorgias and Polus lack power over themselves
13. Socrates' Argument: Justice Must Be Taught
  - a. Justice is good for its possessor no matter what
  - b. Author notes that there are difficulties in defending this claim
  - c. Socrates died for the extreme version [cf. Girard on scapegoating]
  - d. Meaning of **dike** = all-in rightness
14. Callicles
  - a. Philosophical brawler like Thrasymachus in the *Republic*
  - b. Socrates: A wicked man is better off if he is punished [NOTE: Punishment must be distinguished from harm]
  - c. Callicles: The good life consists of gratifying our impulses
  - d. Two interpretations of this view
    - 1) The good life is immoral or amoral
    - 2) Natural justice is transgressive: whatever one can get away with
  - e. Plato: Nature is on the side of justice
15. Callicles: Philosophers Are Terrible Politicians
  - a. According to worldly-wise standards
  - b. The true statesman can do nothing useful in a corrupt environment
16. Socrates: The Wise Man Is Committed to Being Just for Its Own Sake
  - a. He leaves consequences out of the account
  - b. Plato imagines an afterlife in both accounts
    - 1) Aristides the Just
17. Callicles Is Mistaken about the Nature of Good and Evil
  - a. His view of natural right
    - 1) He believes that being ruled, even self-rule, is shameful [cf. Thrasymachus]
  - b. His error: **Self-control** is required for success in even wicked projects
    - 1) **Insatiable desires** [*pleonexia*] disprove Callicles' case
18. Callicles Distinguishes Good and Bad Pleasures
  - a. He needs a test for being a good person

- b. The self-aggrandizer needs some of the qualities of the conventionally good man
- 19. Relationship between the Statesman and the Public
  - a. Socrates is the only true statesman
  - b. What the statesman and the public owe one another
  - c. The true statesman serves for nothing
  - d. The innocent man dies with clean hands
- D. THE *REPUBLIC* (47-48)
  - 1. Differences from *Gorgias*
    - a. We are left with riddles in *Gorgias*
    - b. First book of the *Republic* leaves the subject up in the air
    - c. Socrates then restarts and dominates the discussion
    - d. Exposition of Plato's theory of justice and its political implications
      - 1) How we are to educate and govern ourselves
  - 2. Nature of a Just Society and a Just Political Order
    - a. How Plato's theory of justice differs from that of 21C liberal democracies
      - 1) We think of justice primarily in economic terms
      - 2) Plato looked for the rule of the righteous
    - b. Criticisms of contemporary democracy
      - 1) Psychological chaos that rules the souls of democratic citizens
  - 3. Subject of the *Republic*
    - a. Search for the just society
      - 1) Rhetorical device of seeking justice first in society
      - 2) Setting up a **Kallipolis** = Beautiful City
    - b. Cyclical Historical Process
    - c. Wretched State of the Tyrant's Soul
    - d. Conflict between poetry and philosophy
- E. BOOK ONE (49-55)
  - 1. Festival to a Moon Goddess
    - a. Athens, the city of festivals
    - b. **Glaucon** and **Adeimantus**
  - 2. House of **Polemarchus**
    - a. Ironies
    - b. Temple of Bendis
      - 1) Scene of where the Thirty Tyrants were overthrown and Critias killed
    - c. Thrasymachus
  - 3. **Cephalus** on Old Age
    - a. Sophocles: Old age is liberation from a savage slave master
      - 1) Tranquility of old age
    - b. The importance of good character
    - c. The value of wealth
    - d. Definition of **justice**: Tell the truth and repay your debts
    - e. Classical view of justice
  - 4. Socrates' Question about Returning What We Have Borrowed
    - a. Polemarchus' response: Give every man his due
      - 1) Socrates asks what is due to everyone
    - b. Polemarchus' traditional reply: Do good to our friends and harm to our enemies
  - 5. Socrates: It Is Never Right to Injure Anybody, Making Him Worse Than He Is
    - a. He views doing justice as a skill
      - 1) Punishment does not injure the person who is properly punished
  - 6. Aristotle: Morality Is a *Techné* That Controls the Other Arts or Skills
    - a. Who is best able to help our friends and harm our enemies?
      - 1) Doctors [but contrast the Hippocratic Oath: Do no harm] and sailors
  - 7. A Modern Writer Would Not Call Doing Justice a Skill [It would be useful to speculate why that should be the case; perhaps we do not take it seriously]
    - a. Sticking to one's last [keeping to the work in which one is competent and skilled]
    - b. Properly imposed punishment makes people better; it is their due

- c. Premonitions of this view may be found in Sophocles, but not in Homer
- 8. **Thrasymachus**
  - a. Plato deals him a worse hand than he dealt Callicles
    - 1) His first position: There are no moral standards
    - 2) Second position: A counterintuitive morality
  - b. First position: Moral judgments are depicted as a charade
    - 1) Philosophical amoralism
    - 2) A view later popularized by **Friedrich Nietzsche**
  - c. Second position: Self-aggrandizing behavior is required
    - 1) It is an alternative morality for greater soul figures like Achilles
    - 2) Its moral ruggedness
- 9. Thrasymachus: Justice Is Whatever Is in the Interest of the Stronger
  - a. Whoever gets the upper hand gets to define morality [This is a variation on the "Golden Rule:" Whoever gets the gold makes the rules]
  - b. Vested interests: People define justice to suit themselves [Observe how interest groups seek either to gain a legal advantage or avoid a legal disadvantage; they then fight to protect their turf against reform. This is the nature of entitlements]
  - c. Socrates then traps him in an incoherent argument
- 10. Digression: Socrates Takes the Arguments on a Detour through the Skills That Minister To Everyday Life
  - a. The question is whose interests these skills promote
  - b. Thrasymachus makes the fatal slip of accepting the ordinary notion of justice
  - c. So he falls back on the argument that doing justice is for idiots
- 11. His Second Card: Justice Is for Idiots
  - a. Thrasymachus still hankers after his original claim
  - b. Alexander and the pirate [illustration from Augustine's *City of God*]
  - c. Thrasymachus rejects the traditional view
    - 1) He now holds that justice is a virtue only if it pays off
  - d. Greek conception of ethics
    - 1) The "good life" must benefit the individual who leads it
- 12. Socrates on **Eudaemonia** = Happiness
  - a. Justice is essential to group cooperation
  - b. People do better on average if justice is observed
  - c. The **free-rider** problem
  - d. Danger of **mutual distrust** (diffidence)
- 13. Who Will Guard the Guardians?
  - a. We fear there are many instances where the pursuit of economic interests is best served by violating the precepts of justice
    - 1) **Rational actor model** that people are out to maximize their payoffs
    - 2) Government regulation is no panacea: The state has every incentive to rob the rest of us
- E. THE ARGUMENT AFTER THRASYMACHUS (56-58)
  - 1. The Conflict between Justice and Self-Interest Is Only Apparent
    - a. Most influential utopia in history
    - b. Thrasymachus abandons the argument
    - c. Glaucon restarts the discussion
    - d. The **Ring of Gyges**
    - e. Glaucon sets Socrates an impossible task
  - 2. Creation of a Perfect *Polis* and What It Requires by Way of Education
    - a. Origins of justice: Glaucon's commonsensical view which has been taken seriously since Thomas Hobbes (but it falls flat here)
    - b. Glaucon's Thesis: We are selfish creatures whose moral conduct is a form of **insurance**
      - 1) Justice springs from a hypothetical contract we could have made but did not [anticipation of the later social contract theory]
      - 2) It is a negative Golden Rule

- c. Glaucon failed to start a tradition of natural law thinking; his views are ignored by Socrates
  - 3. Implications: If We Were Immune from the Threat of Punishment (Ring of Gyges), We Would Do Well by Behaving Badly
    - a. Our moral education is via the need to ingratiate ourselves with powerful others
    - b. We thus get educated out of our unrestrained selfishness
    - c. We acquire a conscience and are thereafter kept in check by it
    - d. Glaucon: Morality is artificial and a human invention
    - e. Plato: Morality is inscribed in the natural order
      - 1) **Sophist** view: Nature is amoral
    - f. Aristotle's middle way
  - 4. Examination of Justice in a *Polis*
    - a. **Division of labor**
      - 1) Stoic view is contrasted
      - 2) Plato's more utilitarian picture
    - b. Benefits of **specialization**: Doing what one does best
      - 1) We unite to get the benefits of specialization
    - c. Plato's Spartan proclivities
      - 1) Glaucon's **city of pigs** [Athens was a commercial center filled with novelties; oriental spices were rare in medieval Europe; opening the New World added vanilla and chocolate to the diet]
      - 2) Socrates: Greed and self-aggrandizement lead to wars for the acquisition of territory and wealth
    - d. Consequence: Prosperity means warfare and the need for well-trained soldiers (good guard dogs)
    - e. The human equivalent of good guard dogs are philosophers
      - 1) The *Republic* now becomes a treatise on education
- F. GUARDIANS AND THEIR EDUCATION (58-63)
- 1. The Most Famous Defense of a Meritocracy
    - a. The ruling elite
    - b. Plato's **Academy**
    - c. *Kallipolis*
    - d. Expulsion of poets and artists
      - 1) Music
      - 2) Early training
      - 3) Art as a form of attractive lying
  - 2. Plato's Understanding of Art
    - a. Empirical world of everyday appearance: Distorted picture of Truth
      - 1) World of the **Forms**
      - 2) **Allegory of the Cave**
    - b. Art is a double misrepresentation
      - 1) This is an artful argument against artists
      - 2) Question of irony
    - c. Plato supposed an inability to say what we know
      - 1) reliance on allegories and parable that point us toward the truth
    - d. Socrates' **daimon**
      - 1) Allegorical discussions
  - 3. Education of the Ruling Class
    - a. Women
    - b. Lycurgus
    - c. Ceaseless repetition for the sake of unity
    - d. Plato's family was attached to the Spartan oligarchy
    - e. His rashness in putting forward Spartan ideas
  - 4. The Arts and Virtue
    - a. Concern that bad models elicit [what René Girard calls] mimetic desire
      - 1) Cato the Elder and Jean-Jacques Rousseau

- 2) Inculcation of virtue through a tightly constrained syllabus
      - 3) The same training was extended to girls
    - b. Importance of character formation
  - 5. Two Arguments for Training a Virtuous Elite
    - a. Different kinds of souls (the **Golden or Noble Lie**)
      - 1) **Myth of the metals**: Three class structure
      - 2) System of breeding [eugenics]
      - 3) **Aldous Huxley's** antenatal conditioning
      - 4) Bertrand Russell's claim to priority
      - 5) Eugenic science was allegedly needed to produce a pacified society
      - 6) Huxley's ghastly parody of utopia
      - 7) Plato's Golden Lie contains a deep truth
      - 8) Assumption of a cosmic symmetry between the ideal society and the order of nature
    - b. What reconciles **physis** [nature] with **nomos** [law or convention]: A social structure that reflects the harmony of the universe can be created
      - 1) What makes a meritocracy attractive is the idea of a harmonious natural hierarchy
      - 2) Another reason for combating Callicles and Thrasymachus
      - 3) The rowers in the fleet expected a payoff from war
  - 6. **Thomas Hobbes**
    - a. Deep hostility to democracy
      - 1) Equality is natural; hierarchy is conventional (artificial)
      - 2) Obedience is required for the sake of peace
    - b. Plato's cosmology was shared by Aristotle and other classical writers
      - 1) It subsequently reinforced Christian ideas
  - 7. Plato's Case Could Have Been Made Differently
    - a. A Sociological argument that a state functions best with a clear class structure needs no philosophical backing [cf. Robert Michels' iron law of oligarchy]
      - 1) Modern China
      - 2) Dystopia
- G. JUSTICE DEFINED (63-65)
- 1. Cardinal Virtues
    - a. Workers and temperance
    - b. Auxiliaries and courage
    - c. Guardians and wisdom
    - d. Justice governs the whole
  - 2. Justice (*Dike*) as Overall Rightness
    - a. Aristotle distinguishes two kinds of justice
    - b. Justice and mercy
    - c. Ultimate criterion of rightness: Order in the soul and contributing as we should to the order of the universe and of society
    - d. Contrast with modern liberalism
  - 3. Socrates' Case for a Philosophically-Based Dictatorship [Question: Is This an Allegory of the Role of Reason in the Individual Soul?]
    - a. Bleakness of the lives of Plato's guardians
    - b. Glaucon's and Adeimantus's objections
  - 4. Antipolitical Nature of These Thoughts about Justice
    - a. Two crucial thoughts Plato refused to entertain
      - 1) Rule of law is meant to ensure that individuals are treated justly
        - a) Law and the conflicts that law regulates vanish
      - 2) Fair Allocation of Power
        - a) No place for the idea of legitimate but competing interests
- H. LAST THOUGHTS (65-67)
- 1. Three Later Arguments
  - 2. Why the Rule of the Philosopher Is Required

- a. Need to create a stable *polis* that reflects the order of nature
  - 1) Later arguments for theocracy
- b. Need to find a central role for a spiritual guardian [ancient rulers were seen as mediators between the divine and human realms]
- 3. Question of How That Authority Is to Be Exercised
  - a. Medieval Christianity and Islam
  - b. **Allegory of the Cave**
    - 1) Desired reluctance of the enlightened to return to the world of illusion
- 4. Nothing Much Happens in Utopia [*i.e.*, it is boring] [cf. Hegel's idea of the end of history]
- 5. Two Large Questions about the Common People Remain
  - a. Whether they live just lives
  - b. Question of what they do
- I. DECAYING STATES (67-70)
  - 1. **Cycle** of Political Change [cf. Polybius]
    - a. Honor Supersedes wisdom (**timocracy**)
    - b. Timocracy degenerates into **oligarchy**
      - 1) The double nature of oligarchy: It is two states, not one
    - c. Revolution ushers in **democracy**
  - 2. The Principle of Democracy Is Freedom
    - a. **Isegoria**
    - b. Result: **Eleutheria** = The Masterless
    - c. Plato's complaint that democracy is license
    - d. **Tyranny**
  - 3. Enthusiasm for Cyclical Theories: A Recurrent Feature of the History of Political Thinking
    - a. Spartan timocracy
    - b. Athenian democracy
    - c. Tyranny
  - 4. Plato's Premise: The Souls of Citizens Mirror the Character of States
    - a. Democratic citizens: Half-crazy with a passion for novelties
    - b. The tyrant: An ever-embattled enemy to the world
  - 5. Account of the Fate of the Just and the Unjust Man in the Afterlife
    - a. Scipio's Dream (Cicero)
    - b. **Myth of Er**
      - 1) Plato Fails to Meet Glaucon's challenge
    - c. Immanuel Kant: Why we hanker after an afterlife
    - d. Worthlessness of the tyrant's life
  - 6. Plato's Ideal Polity Belongs to Soulcraft rather than Statecraft
    - a. Author's conclusion: Plato is in denial
      - 1) He wants people to be of only one mind about all important questions
    - b. *Brave New World*: A parodic commentary on the corrupt form of 20C utopianism
    - c. Hobbes's *Leviathan*: Exploration of how far we must agree if there is to be peace
    - d. Plato simply dissolves the problem of establishing a just polity

## Review

Aristotle's critique	Seventh Letter	voluntary exile
Sophists	Saint Augustine	Cicero
Polus	Callicles	Thrasymachus
Gorgias	Aristophanes	self-control
selfish motives	<i>Dike</i>	<i>Kallipolis</i>
Glaucon	Adeimantus	Polemarchus
Cephalus	Friedrich Nietzsche	<i>eudaemia</i>
free rider problem	mutual distrust (diffidence)	rational actor model
Ring of Gyges	insurance	division of labor
specialization	city of pigs	Academy
forms	Allegory of the Cave	<i>daimon</i>



Golden Lie  
*physis*  
 cycle  
 democracy  
 tyranny

myth of the metals  
*nomos*  
 timocracy  
*isegoria*  
 Myth of Er

Aldous Huxley  
 Thomas Hobbes  
 oligarchy  
*Eleutheria*

## CHAPTER 3: ARISTOTLE: POLITICS IS NOT PHILOSOPHY

### Outline

- A. LIFE AND TIMES (71-73)
1. Aristotle Was Embroiled in Politics
    - a. Tutor of Alexander
    - b. Father-in-law of Antipater [who was the regent of the empire after Alexander's death and rumored to be the assassin]
    - c. Plato's Academy
    - d. Changing fortunes of Athens
  2. **Hermias**
    - a. Tyrant of Lesbos: former slave of great ability
    - b. Aristotle's marriage to Hermias's niece
    - c. Aristotle summoned to Pella to tutor Alexander
  3. Founding of the **Lyceum**, 335
    - a. Athenian revolts against Philip
    - b. Destruction of Thebes
    - c. Demosthenes
    - d. Xenocrates took over the Academy
    - e. Aristotle's **empirical** [experience-based, practical] investigations
      - 1) 158 Greek constitutions
  4. Lack of Tranquility in Athens
    - a. Hostility to Macedonian hegemony
    - b. Unpopularity of Antipater
    - c. Awkwardness of Aristotle's status as a foreigner
    - d. Friendship with Lycurgus
    - e. Withdrawal from Athens following the death of Alexander
    - f. Death
- B. ARISTOTLE'S POLITICAL PREJUDICES (73-75)
1. Repugnant Views on Slavery and Women
    - a. Relation of **master** to inferior
      - 1) Household (*oikos*) of a citizen
      - 2) Menial work (**manual labor**) unfits a man for political life
    - b. **Fathers**
      - 1) Royal rule over children and constitutional rule over wives
  2. Two Peculiarities
    - a. Acquisition of slaves is a branch of war or hunting
    - b. The notion of **natural slaves**
      - 1) Hermias
  3. Woman's subordinate role
- C. TELEOLOGY: NATURE AND POLITICS (75-78)
1. Aristotle's Conception of Nature
    - a. Man: A **political animal** [the city-state is what makes him fully human]
    - b. Doctrine of the **four causes**: material (matter), formal (form), efficient (how something is effected, produced, originated), and final (the goal or purpose).
    - c. Teleological explanation
    - d. **Scientific revolution** [17C] banished **teleology**

- e. Aristotle included human contrivance (what we would call artificial) in the category “natural”
- f. **Roman Catholic Church:** Natural law and divine law reinforce each other
- g. Aristotle’s nature was itself divine
- 2. Slaves “by Nature”
  - a. Nature exhibits a **hierarchy**
    - 1) Highest things aim at the highest good
- 3. What Nature Does, Shows What It Aims to Achieve
  - a. Canonical standards
  - b. Four kinds of cause
  - c. Search for **self-sufficiency** in the state
  - d. Discussion of revolution
- 4. Aristotle Did Not Share Plato’s View of Reality
  - a. Plato: World of sense a poor shadow of reality
    - 1) Empirical world a botched copy of trans-empirical reality
  - b. Aristotle: We perceive reality
    - 1) Successful explanation should **save the appearances** [which are not necessarily true]: The expression was used by Simplicius (about Aristotle), Milton in *Paradise Lost*, and by Owen Barfield
  - c. Galileo
- 5. Politics as a Form of Natural History
  - a. Thomas Hobbes admired Aristotle’s biology
  - b. Goal: Aim only at as much precision as the subject matter permits
    - 1) e.g., Aboriculture
  - c. *Ethics* and *Politics*: Focus on what is needed
    - 1) We seek **knowledge for the sake of action** [prudence]
    - 2) Complaint against Plato
  - d. Truth Sought for Practical Purposes
- 6. *Polis* Is Prior to the Individual
  - a. Politics is the **master science**
  - b. Role of the Citizen in Enabling the State to Flourish
- D. ETHICS AND *THE POLITICS* (78-81)
  - 1. *Polis* Exists by Nature
    - a. Living the good life in common
    - b. Ethics: The study of living well
      - 1) Happiness approved by reason
  - 2. Happiness of a Good Person
    - a. Circular reasoning
      - 1) Virtues
    - b. Examination of particular virtues
    - c. Many excellences are not moral in the modern sense
  - 3. Aristotle’s Understanding of Justice
    - a. Critique of Plato
    - b. Justice in the usual sense is **distributive** according to merit [what is due]
    - c. Virtue
    - d. Limits of argumentative possibility
  - 4. It Is Rational to Be Just
    - a. Nature means for the just to flourish
    - b. Advantage of a **society of just persons**
    - c. Justice is easier when supported by the other virtues
    - d. Good person wishes to be just for its own sake
  - 5. Modern View: Self-Seeking Utility Maximizers
    - a. Polus, Callicles, Thrasymachus: Using others as means to our ends
    - b. Aristotle: Hierarchy of goals, each subordinated to a search for excellence
    - c. Aristotle denies the premise of “greed is good”
  - 6. Human Beings Seek Their Own Well-Being, But Not Always Effectively

- a. Misguided wants and mistakes are disconnected from the good
- E. POLITICAL ANALYSIS (81-82)
  - 1. Comparative Studies
    - a. Aristotle sent students to collect information [The historian David Hackett Fischer did the same for *Albion's Seed*]
      - 1) Constitution of Athens
  - 2. Arrangement of Politics
    - a. Incomplete consideration of the education of the young
    - b. Nature of political association vs. that of the domestic household
  - 3. Sprawling Character of the Book
    - a. Nature of citizenship
    - b. Qualifications of citizenship
    - c. Attack on ideal state theory
- F. POLITICAL MAN (83-85)
  - 1. Three Famous Observations
    - a. *Polis* exists to satisfy the **highest goal** of social life
    - b. It is self sufficient
    - c. It alone should be governed politically
      - 1) Authority of the statesman should not be conflated with other leaders
      - 2) An association is to be understood in terms of its purpose rather than its origin
  - 2. Focus on the Greek City-State
    - a. Place where humans can fulfill their potential
  - 3. Philosopher's Life of **Contemplation** [*vita contemplative*]
    - a. Most prefer the ***vita activa***
    - b. Self-sufficiency of the philosopher: ordinary categories of success do not apply
    - c. Tension between the search for absolutes and the search for a *modus vivendi*
  - 4. Analysis of the Nature of Households
    - a. Male head of household
      - 1) Father's authority is not based on force
      - 2) **Despotes**: Master only over slaves
    - b. Extent and nature of authority is functional
    - c. Locke and the American Constitution
- G. SLAVERY (85-88)
  - 1. Authority Follows Function
    - a. Manual labor seen as beneath the dignity of citizens
      - 1) American South: arguments
    - b. Slaves seen as animated tools
    - c. Military defeat was often a source of slavery
      - 1) Slaves were often better educated than their masters
    - d. Depiction of the idle household slaves in the comedies of Aristophanes
    - e. Hard and dangerous labor:
      - 1) Silver mines of Laurium
      - 2) Sicilian quarries
  - 2. Relationship between Master and Slave
    - a. Slavery is for the most part conventional
    - b. Aristotle's compromise: Greeks should not enslave Greeks
    - c. Differences from modern racism
  - 3. Aristotle's Contradictions
    - a. Friendly with slaves
    - b. Prospect of **manumission**
      - 1) Antebellum slavery
    - c. POWs in a just war [International law theorist Hugo Grotius endorsed this]
    - d. Slaves and wives
    - e. Robotized plows [Karel Čapek popularized the idea in *R.U.R.*]
    - f. Choice of slavery: Question is a question of its rationality

4. Aristotle's Second Definition of Politics
    - a. Why only some people can practice politics
      - 1) Cold and barren Scythia
      - 2) Hot and enervating Persia
        - a) Persians were doubly non-self-governing
        - b) Unaccountability of the satraps [administrators]
    - b. Greece's healthy medium
- H. ECONOMIC ACTIVITY (88-92)
1. Economic Activity Can Threaten Political Life
    - a. Spartans
      - 1) Rapacious while away from the repressive discipline of their own city
      - 2) Sparta as a boot camp
      - 3) Spartans were easy to bribe
  2. Aim: Create **Public-Spirited Citizens**
    - a. Aristotle did not admire the Spartan contempt for physical comfort
    - b. He mocked Plato's belief in common property
      - 1) Neglect: What belongs to everybody, belongs to nobody [cf. Garrett Hardin's *Tragedy of the Commons*]
      - 2) Need to take ownership
  3. Some Work Regarded as Intrinsically Degrading
    - a. Nature tells us what we need
    - b. Modern Economists
      - 1) Just price disregarded, although it was favored in the Middle Ages
    - c. Trade unions
    - d. Natural needs set the bounds of acceptability
  4. Money is Problematic
    - a. Its value is what needs explaining
    - b. Two plausible views
      - 1) Value is derived from the effort of the producers (labor theory of value)
      - 2) Value is measured by the desires of the purchasers
    - c. Combined view: **Price** measures **scarcity relative to demand**
  5. Idea of Natural Value
    - a. Inspiration for medieval **usury laws**
      - 1) Anti-Semitic aspects
    - b. Aristotle's organic view
    - c. Barren money [economists call this rent] cannot breed
  6. Money and Banking: Solvents of Social Order
  7. Polis Is Best Governed by Gentleman Farmers
    - a. Limited leisure
    - b. Government of laws and not men
    - c. Politics as the master art
- I. CITIZENSHIP AND CONSTITUTION (92-97)
1. The Topics That Keep His Work Alive
  2. Qualities Needed by Citizens and Individuals
    - a. Loyalty
    - b. Whether a good citizen must be a good man
    - c. Machiavelli's denial: Loyalty to country must trump goodness
    - d. Rousseau's fear: He wanted a simple, un-commercial republic
    - e. Difficulty of retraining young soldiers for civilian life
  3. Citizenship
    - a. Modern notion: Citizenship is an **entitlement**
    - b. Greek ostracism
    - c. Women
    - d. No questions about identities and entitlements in a world devoid of passports
  4. Question of Who Can Safely Be Given the Right to Rule
    - a. Finding virtue in a man

- b. No qualitative difference among men to support absolute authority
- c. Yet there are important differences of degree
- 5. The Common Need for Protection Is Not a Basis for Citizenship, but What Then?
  - a. Aristotle was a **resident alien** [metic]
  - b. Something like the idea of birthright was suggested by later Stoics
  - c. Best candidates: Properly educated, economically independent, native-born free men
  - d. Servile occupations are a disqualification
  - e. Risk to all from errors of government is not grounds for the citizenship of all
  - f. Test of **autonomy**
- 6. No Greek Could Be Uninterested in Politics
  - a. Leon Trotsky
  - b. Apathy would have been incomprehensible
  - c. Class warfare
  - d. Struggle to restrict or extend citizenship
  - e. Savagery of political violence
  - f. Thirty Tyrants
- 7. Question of the Best Form of Constitution
  - a. Rule of the best
    - 1) *Panbasileus*
  - b. Ideal aristocracy
    - 1) **Hereditary ruling elite**
    - 2) Critique: Genetic transmission cannot be relied on
- 8. An Aristotelian Solution
  - a. Modern representative government
  - b. James Madison and James Mill: Popular government on a large scale
  - c. Idea of representative democracy
  - d. Rousseau supported elective aristocracy but denounced representation
- J. ARISTOTLE'S CLASSIFICATION OF CONSTITUTIONS (97-99)
  - 1. **Aristocracy**
    - a. Habit of becoming oligarchies
    - b. Sexpartite distinction
  - 2. Three **Virtuous Forms** of Government
    - a. Kingship, aristocracy, and *politeia*
  - 3. Three **Corrupt Forms**
    - a. Tyranny, oligarchy, democracy
    - b. **Ochlocracy**: Mob rule
    - c. **Demos**: The poor many
    - d. Aristotle's argument against universal suffrage
      - 1) Banausic trades: Manual labor
    - e. Remedy: Narrow democracy or expanded aristocracy
  - 4. Excellence of Citizens Connected with Constitutional Form
    - a. No man is so naturally superior to others that they will obey him unquestioningly
    - b. What is needed is checks and balances
    - c. Modern concern with human rights and institutions
  - 5. Surprises
    - a. **Lottery** is the most democratic mode of choice
    - b. **Politeia** is a happy medium between aristocracy and democracy
- K. THE AVOIDANCE OF STASIS (100-105)
  - 1. Theory of Revolution
    - a. Two parts
      - 1) **Stasis**: Stalemate
      - 2) Bloody civil war
  - 2. Struggle for Power
    - a. Loss of populace's confidence by the ruling elite
    - b. Seizure of power by some new ruling group

- 1) **Revolution vs. *coup d'etat***
3. Tension between Democratic and Oligarchic Factions
  - a. Conflict of interests and sense of injustice
  - b. **Two conceptions of justice**
    - 1) Democratic
      - a) Aristotle had no sympathy for economic equality
    - 2) Oligarchic
      - a) Monopolization of power and wealth
4. Aristotle's Recipes for Holding off the Evils of Stasis
  - a. His **advice to tyrants**
    - 1) Keep opponents divided
    - 2) Rule moderately and virtuously
      - a) Do not affront family pride and honor
    - 3) Tyrants were more uneasy then than now
  - b. His advice to democrats
5. Theory of the **Mixed Constitution**
  - a. Empirically-minded theorizing
  - b. **Polybius**
  - c. British politics
  - d. American checks and balances
  - e. Aristotle matched political power with economic interest
    - 1) Lozenge-shaped [bell-curve] **distribution of wealth**
    - 2) Middle class
    - 3) Economic basis of political stability
6. Aristotle Relied on Good Sense and Steadiness of the Middling Sort
  - a. Seymour Martin Lipset
7. Aristotle's Focus on the Character of the **Middle Class**
  - a. Moderation of desires
  - b. Lack of precision
  - c. Panic-stricken German middle class
- L. IDEAL STATES (105-110)
  1. Aristotle's Aim: The Best Practicable State
    - a. The good life
      - 1) Development of all the public and private virtues
      - 2) Diversity of people and interest brought together
  2. Animal/Human Distinction
    - a. Gregarious animals
    - b. Political character of human beings: United by agreement
    - c. Hobbes' misuse of Aristotle's argument
  3. Aristotle's Severe Criticism of Plato's *Republic* and *Laws*
    - a. Plato was obsessed with disunity
  4. Plato Purifies Politics to Death
    - a. He turns the city into something else
    - b. Impulse to self-sufficiency
      - 1) *Polis* is logically prior to the individual
      - 2) Without mutual discipline men became worse than animals
  5. Aristotle's Defense of the Family and **Private Property**
    - a. Question of happiness
  6. Ideal State of Books 7 and 8
    - a. Apparent inconsistency
    - b. The very different tone set in Book 2
  7. Aristotle's Is the Town Planner's **Ideal State**
    - a. Size: A face-to-face community [*Gemeinschaft* of Ferdinand Tönnies]
    - b. Common tables
  8. Aristotle Is Not the Ancestor of Pluralism
    - a. Authoritarian perspective

- b. No concept of privacy
- c. Compulsory abortion
- d. Quickening
- 9. His Views of Freedom Are Not Ours
  - a. Theory of liberal education
  - b. John Locke's more utilitarian, vocational view
- 10. Aim: Rule of Natural Aristocrats

## Review

Hermias	Lyceum	empirical (empiricism)
master	manual labor	father
natural slave	political animal	four causes
scientific revolution	teleology	Roman Catholic Church
hierarchy	self-sufficiency	save the appearances
knowledge for the sake of action	master science	distributive
society of just persons	highest goal	<i>vita activa</i> (active life)
contemplation	<i>despotes</i>	manumission
public-spirited citizens	price	scarcity relative to demand
usury laws	entitlement	resident alien
autonomy	hereditary ruling elite	aristocracy
three virtuous forms	three corrupt forms	ochlocracy
<i>demos</i>	lottery	<i>politeia</i>
stasis	revolution	<i>coup d'etat</i>
two conceptions of justice	advice to tyrants	mixed constitution
Polybius	distribution of wealth	middle class
private property	Ideal State	

## CHAPTER 4: ROMAN INSIGHTS: POLYBIUS AND CICERO

### Outline

- A. POLYBIUS AND CICERO (111-117)
  - 1. **Polybius**
    - a. Intellectual successors
    - b. Mixed republican constitution
    - c. His life
  - 2. Exile in Rome
    - a. Scipio Africanus the Younger
    - b. Final destruction of Carthage
    - c. **Scipio's Dream** in Cicero's *De Republica*
    - d. Polybius's mediation with Rome after a rebellion
  - 3. **Cicero**
    - a. **Equites** [Roman cavalry]
    - b. **Cursus honorum** [The course of offices, beginning with military service, then by minimum age: quaestor [auditor] (30), aedile [public works and festivals] (36), praetor [commander or magistrate] (39), and finally consul (42)]
    - c. Social war
    - d. Diodotus
  - 4. Political Advancement
    - a. Sulla
  - 5. Question in Sicily
    - a. Prosecution of Verres
  - 6. Consul

- a. **Cataline conspiracy**
- b. *Inter armas silent leges* [Roughly: In times of war the laws fall silent]
- 7. *Populares* [Demagogues or Populists] vs. *Optimates* [Best Ones]
- 8. First Triumvirate
  - a. Exiled by Clodius
  - b. Restored by Pompey
  - c. Pardon by Caesar
  - d. Assassination of Caesar
- 9. Destruction of the Republic
  - a. Battle of Actium
  - b. Philippics against Mark Antony
- B. POLITICS FOR STATESMEN, NOT PHILOSOPHERS (117-120)
  - 1. Statecraft
    - a. Cicero's primary concern
  - 2. Philosophy's Contrast
    - a. Plato and Aristotle
  - 3. Political Theory
    - a. Extreme cases sharpen the distinction
      - 1) Plato and Hobbes
      - 2) Polybius and Machiavelli
    - b. Statecraft focuses on the political practitioner
      - 1) Its strong empirical bias
  - 4. Plato's *Statesman*
    - a. Ironic commentary on statecraft
    - b. The high stakes of *salus populi suprema lex est* [the welfare of the people shall be the highest law]
    - c. Plato's godlike superior of the human herd
  - 5. Aristotle's Politics
    - a. His limited discussion of skills and temperament
    - b. Political life theorized
    - c. *Nicomachean Ethics*
  - 6. Cicero Made Oratory Central
    - a. Object: To teach statesman
    - b. *De officiis*
    - c. Philipp Melanchthon
    - d. Beauty of Cicero's Latin
- C. THE ORIGINALITY OF POLYBIUS (120-126)
  - 1. Rise of the Roman Empire
    - a. One Italian tribe among many
    - b. Struggles between the patrician and plebeian classes
  - 2. Conflict with Carthage
    - a. Three Punic (Phoenician) Wars
    - b. Trading city
    - c. Aristocratic oligarchy
    - d. Hannibal
    - e. Third War and final destruction
    - f. Macedonian Wars
  - 3. Book Six
    - a. Mixed government
    - b. John Adams
    - c. Lycurgus
  - 4. **Theory of the Mixed Republic**
    - a. Polybius
    - b. *Politeia*
  - 5. The Strength of Mixtures
    - a. Bronze



- b. Mules
- c. Cicero
- d. Plato on Athenian demagogue
- e. Polybius' general theory of stable government
- 6. Cyclical Theory of Constitutional Change
  - a. Sufficiency of the original theory
  - b. Classical view that **change is decay**
  - c. Miracle in Philadelphia
- 7. Question: How Had Rome Done It?
  - a. Aristotelian approach
  - b. Utopia is uninteresting
  - c. Destruction of Carthage
  - d. Rome's beginning: A botched constitution
    - 1) Trial and error
- 8. Sparta
  - a. **Lycurgus**
  - b. Inadequacies of economic arrangements
  - c. War funds borrowed from Persia
- 9. Belief That the Founding Moment Is Decisive
  - a. Polybian recipe
  - b. **George Washington**
- 10. Romans Broke the Rules and Prospered: Trial and Error
  - a. Endemic **class conflict**
  - b. Sparta's initial perfection
  - c. Cato the Elder
  - d. Genius of Lycurgus credited for Lysander's success
- D. THE PECULIARITIES OF ROME EXPLAINED (126-128)
  - 1. Polybius's Hesitation
    - a. Classification of constitutional types
    - b. Monarchy vs. kingship
  - 2. **Motors of Political Change**
    - a. Rise by talent vs. by heredity
    - b. Degeneration of aristocracies into oligarchies
    - c. Oligarchy to democracy to dictatorship: **Most common cycle**
  - 3. Popular Leaders [Demagogues]
    - a. Julius Caesar
    - b. Alcibiades
    - c. Caesar Augustus
- E. ROMAN SUCCESS (128-132)
  - 1. Equipose
    - a. Roman liberty
    - b. Rule of law: **libertas** = freedom under the law
    - c. Sparta and Rome
    - d. **Self-discipline** sustained the rule of law
    - e. Machiavelli
    - f. Invocation in the American and French revolutions
  - 2. What Freedom Was Not
    - a. Individual liberty and *laissez faire* were not in mind
    - b. Athenian democracy
    - c. Eligibility for office confined to the *equites* [gentlemen]
    - d. It was **freedom from personal oppression**
      - 1) St. Paul
    - e. *Cives sine suffragio* [citizenship without the vote]
    - f. **Censor morum** [moral censor]: No sharp line dividing private from public realm
    - g. Negative liberty: Liable only for legally prescribed penalties for misconduct
    - h. Positive liberty: Entitlement to hold office depended on status

3. Mixed Constitution
    - a. Polybius was not thinking of modern checks and balances
    - b. One untidy system
    - c. Montesquieu introduced the idea of checks and balances
  4. Consuls
    - a. Vetoes
    - b. Eligibility of plebeians
    - c. **Cursus honorum**
      - 1) Quaestor and praetor
  5. Senate
    - a. Enlargement under Caesar as dictator
    - b. Restrictions and economic activities
    - c. Executive power when the consuls were absent
    - d. James Madison
    - e. **Senatus consulta**: Advisory judgments rather than legislative or judicial power
    - f. Criminal trials
    - g. Concurrence
- F. CITIZENS (132-36)
1. Saint Paul: *Civis Romanus Sum*
    - a. Intricacy of rights and duties of citizenship
      - 1) A variety of statuses
    - b. Key elements
      - 1) Incorporation of conquered peoples
      - 2) Some degree of protection from exploitation
      - 3) Pathway opened to military and political careers
  2. Citizenship Based in the State's Military and Financial Needs
    - a. Liability for military service
      - 1) Citizen militias
    - b. Periodic censuses
  3. Three **Orders of Citizens**
    - a. Senators or patricians
      - 1) Forced to concede *ius suffragii* [right to vote] and *ius honorum* [right to hold office] to the plebeians [populus]
    - b. Populus: Five classes
      - 1) Censors allocated citizens to the 35 tribes
      - 2) Tribes were further subdivided into ten centuries by financial standing and age
    - c. Equites [knights, gentry, gentlemen] formed 18 additional centuries
  4. Soldiers Provided Their Own Armament and Equipment [Idea of the Citizen-Soldier]
    - a. Hoplites
    - b. Military service was required prior to office-holding
    - c. Image of the sturdy yeoman
    - d. Roman model of the "well-regulated militia"
    - e. Civilian role
  5. System of Graduated Citizenship
    - a. Admission of conquered cities to citizenship **sine suffragio**
      - 1) Rome's nearest neighbors were assimilated first
    - b. Cicero's Arpinum was admitted to full citizenship only in 188 BC
  6. **Edict of Caracalla**, 212 AD
    - a. Motive: To widen the tax base
    - b. Women's property rights
    - c. Family politics: Marriage, divorce, and adoption
  7. Political Rights
    - a. *Optimo iure*
    - b. *Minore iure*
    - c. **ius provocationis**

- d. Other rights
- 8. **Patria Potestas** [Absolute Patriarchal Power]
  - a. *Manus* of father or husband
  - b. Slaves
  - c. Love for daughters
  - d. "Clientelage" [cf. Don Vito Corleone's friendship]
- G. CICERO (136-42)
  - 1. Political Theory
    - a. Decline of the role of oratory
    - b. *De republica* and *De legibus*
    - c. *De officiis*
    - d. The Laws [*De legibus*]
    - e. *Republic*
    - f. On Duties
    - g. **Law of nature**
      - 1) Stoic idea
      - 2) Adopted by the Church
  - 2. Idealized Roman Republic
    - a. **Mores**
    - b. Machiavelli satirized Cicero's advice to statesman
    - c. Influence of Polybius
    - d. Fluctuation between constitutional and heroic emphasis
      - 1) Conspiracy of Catiline
  - 3. Rhetorical Tension
    - a. Heroic founders and refounders
    - b. Republican vs. modern views
  - 4. Fragmentary Character of *De Republica* and *De Legibus*
    - a. *Mos maiorum*
    - b. Scipio Africanus the Younger
      - 1) Indirect rebuke of Plato
    - c. **Scipio's Dream**
      - 1) Reworking of the Myth of Er
      - 2) Music of the spheres
      - 3) Macrobius
  - 5. Cicero Defined the Republican Tradition
    - a. **Res publica** is the *res populi*
      - 1) People "own" the republic
    - b. Justice is the defining feature
      - 1) Corrupt state is not commonwealth
      - 2) No republic if the government is perverted to serve private interests
  - 6. Common Good is the Pursuit of Happiness According to Reason
    - a. Good institutions protect the common interest from erosion by private interests
  - 7. *De republica*
    - a. Celebration of the success of the Roman Republic
    - b. Tiberius Gracchus
    - c. Rome had the chance to learn by trial and error
  - 8. Cicero's Account of Roman Politics is More Hardheaded
    - a. Polybius exaggerated the real power of the ordinary Roman
    - b. The centuries
    - c. Rome was a plutocracy
    - d. Roman *libertas*
  - 9. Merits of Mixed Governments
    - a. Polybius concentrated on the negative virtues
    - b. Aristocratic council
    - c. Judicial council
    - d. Theory of checks and balances

10. Positive Component
  - a. Advantages to rule by one person, a true aristocracy, and rule by many
  - b. Mixed government attempts to secure the desirable elements of each
  - c. Modern conception of the many is more inclusive
- H. GOOD LAW AND THE GOOD CITIZEN (143-48)
  1. Best of All: Roman Republic before Class War
    - a. Nature of law and the rule of law
    - b. Relationship between positive law and natural law
    - c. *De legibus* focuses on the regulation of religious and ritual conduct
  2. Difference From Plato's *Laws*
    - a. Relationship between natural law and particular law
    - b. Laws must be made properly and for the right reasons
      - 1) ***Injusta lex nulla est*** [an unjust law is no law]
    - c. Contrast with **legal positivism** [law equated with will or command rather than discovery, as in natural law]
  3. *De Officiis*
    - a. It induces mixed feelings
    - b. Most disputes between philosophers are terminological
      - 1) One truth, many formulations
  4. Separation of Duty and Self-interest
    - a. Hostility to the **Epicureans** because they morality into self-interest
    - b. Being just or brave does not always benefit us, but there is no irresolvable conflict between the useful and the honorable
    - c. Morally good life is naturally attractive to us
    - d. Four **cardinal virtues** [wisdom or prudence, justice, "greatness of spirit" or courage, moderation]
    - e. Wise action is better than theoretical knowledge
  5. Foundations of Ethics: Reason and Natural Sociability
    - a. Rational inquiry
    - b. We want the company of friends for their own sake
    - c. Community
  6. Justice
    - a. Distinction between justice and benevolence
    - b. We must not be generous with what is not our own
    - c. Honor and decorum
  7. He Assimilates Philosophical Arguments to Roman *mos maiorum*
    - a. His talents as an advocate
    - b. Fate of Atilius Regulus
      - 1) Promises made under duress to an enemy must still be kept
    - c. Generosity [cf. Cincinnatus vs. a "generous" would-be tyrant, Spurius Maelius]
  8. Cicero's Style
    - a. The lion and the fox
  9. He Could Not Be the Savior of the Roman Republic
    - a. A valedictory note to his reflections
    - b. The spiritual and moral future lay ahead with Christianity
    - c. Constantine and Theodosius
    - d. Augustine's *City of God*
      - 1) Cicero was one of its targets

## Review

Polybius  
equites  
theory of the mixed republic  
George Washington  
*libertas*

Scipio's Dream  
*cursus honorum*  
change is decay  
motors of political change  
self-discipline

Cicero  
Cataline conspiracy  
Lycurgus  
most common cycle  
freedom from personal oppression

*ensor morum*  
orders of citizens  
*ius provocationis*  
*mores*  
*injusta lex nulla est*  
cardinal virtues

*cursus honorum*  
*sine suffragio*  
*patria potestas*  
*Scipio's Dream*  
legal positivism

*Senatus consulta*  
Edict of Caracalla  
law of nature  
*res publica*  
Epicureans

## CHAPTER 5: AUGUSTINE'S TWO CITIES

### Outline

- A. AUGUSTINE'S LIFE AND TIMES (149-154)
  - 1. Augustine's Importance
    - a. Impact of his ideas
    - b. Controversial issues
  - 2. Background
    - a. Berber ethnicity
    - b. Childhood
  - 3. Schooling
    - a. Rhetoric in Carthage
    - b. Mistress and son
  - 4. Professor of Rhetoric in Milan
    - a. Western capital moved from Milan to Ravenna
    - b. Ambrose
    - c. Manichaeism
    - d. Neoplatonism
    - e. Hippo
  - 5. *Confessions*
    - a. Reflections on the mysteriousness of human existence
  - 6. Life as a Bishop
    - a. Steady decline in the west
    - b. City of God
    - c. Alaric and the Visigoths
    - d. Military indiscipline
    - e. Vandals
  - 7. Pastoral Duties
    - a. Intellectual life was predominately Greek
    - b. First Latin fathers
  - 8. Intellectual Context
    - a. Provincial African church
    - b. Aristocratic laissez-faire
    - c. Crystallization of Catholic doctrine
    - d. Augustine's uncompromising views
    - e. High price of these views
  - 9. Worldview
    - a. Pre-Christian beliefs
    - b. Mysticism of oriental mystery religions
    - c. Doctrinal pressures of Augustine
    - d. Grace of God
    - e. Theological edifice
- B. POLITICS AND RELIGION (154-158)
  - 1. Changes
    - a. Death of the Republic
    - b. Principate [rule by the First Citizen, the Princeps]

- c. Republican forms preserved
- d. Third century imperial transformation
- 2. Imperial System
  - a. Patchwork of local regimes
  - b. Emphasis on obedience and order
  - c. Persian view of the ruler's status
- 3. Transformation in a Christian Empire
  - a. Theodosius
  - b. Barbarian kingdoms
  - c. Papacy
  - d. Latin became a universal language
- 4. Catholic Church
  - a. Only universal institution of authority over the western empire until Pippin
  - b. Spiritualization of Roman universality
  - c. Multiple centers of power
  - d. Ingredients for distinctive institutions of church and state
- 5. Ambiguity of the Definitions of Politics and Religion
  - a. Open questions
  - b. Christian vs. pagan politics
- 6. Christian Political Theology
  - a. Fulfillment lies in the hereafter
    - 1) Early happiness
    - 2) Abstentionism
  - b. Christ's involvement in everyday life
  - c. Imminence of Christ's return undermined a concern with early politics
- 7. Civic Life Impinged on Christians
  - a. Punishments
    - 1) Scapegoats
  - b. Public obligations of the higher classes
  - c. Vexed issues
  - d. Intellectual apparatus for answering these questions
- C. MANICHAEANISM (158-162)
  - 1. Paradox
    - a. Two cities foreshadowed by *Scipio's Dream*
  - 2. **Manichaean "hearer"**
    - a. No unified authoritative source of Christian belief
    - b. Repression of ideas
    - c. Mani
      - 1) Problem of evil
  - 3. Dualism
    - a. God is good, created world is evil
    - b. Vegetarianism
    - c. Sun worship
    - d. Zoroastrian influence
  - 4. Attractions of Manichaeism
    - a. Innocent suffering
      - 1) Augustine bit the bullet
    - b. Persistence of Manichaeism
  - 5. How It Differed from Christianity
    - a. Rejection of Sonship of Christ
    - b. Great teacher
    - c. Christ was seen as pure spirit
    - d. Resurrection: Emancipation of Christ's spirit from its earthly appearance
  - 6. Variety of Gnostic Sects
    - a. All of the Gnostic sects were at odds with the two **central Christian doctrines**
      - 1) Incarnation and the resurrection of the body

7. Two elements of religious persuasion
    - a. Lightning rod for powerful emotions
    - b. Persuasiveness of its picture of the human condition
      - 1) Augustine's problem of evil
  8. Manichaeism Is a Two-Tier Doctrine of the Spiritual Life
    - a. The devout reduced to the fleshliness of existence
      - 1) The *perfecti*
- D. FROM MANICHAEANISM TO CHRISTIANITY (162-163)
1. Neoplatonic Philosophy
    - a. **Plotinus** and Porphyry
    - b. **Cicero**
    - c. *Libido dominationis* [or *libido dominandi*]
  2. What Augustine Learned from the **Neoplatonists**
    - a. Shadow of the true world
    - b. Evil is privation
  3. St. Paul
    - a. "Tolle lege" [Take, read]
    - b. Conversion
    - c. Career questions
- E. PRACTICAL POLITICS AND THEORETICAL POLITICS: THE PROVOCATION FOR THE CITY OF GOD (163-169)
1. Scholarly Life
    - a. Augustine's political theory is a later reconstruction
    - b. *The City of God*
    - c. Desirability of true faith
    - d. Scruples about how it was to be achieved
  2. Sack of Rome
    - a. Decline of imperial Rome
    - b. Psychological shock
    - c. Persecution of Christians for "atheism"
    - d. Nero
  3. Cicero Turned Inside Out
    - a. **Scipio's Dream**
    - b. Standards necessary for a *res publica*
    - c. Universal standards of justice
  4. Subversion of These Claims
    - a. Limited free will
    - b. No state can be a *res publica* in the Ciceronian sense
  5. **Two Claims**
    - a. No pagan state practices Ciceronian justice
      - 1) None gives god his dues
      - 2) Non can be a true *res populi*
      - 3) Roman charge against Christians
      - 4) Augustine's retort: the old gods kept their side of the bargain
    - b. Even a Christian state falls short
      - 1) Only God can dispense true justice
      - 2) **Love** is the foundation of human affairs
      - 3) Three agents in action
  6. The Individual Will
    - a. **Plotinus: Evil as Privation**
    - b. Centrality of the problem of the will
    - c. Breaches with the Platonic tradition
  7. Theft of the Pears
    - a. Doubly symbolic crime
    - b. Reasons for such misbehavior
      - 1) **Pride**

- a) Thomas Hobbes' insight
  - 2) **Approval** [and complicity]
    - a) Non-Manichaeian and non-Platonic conclusion
    - b) Freedom of the will only belonged to Adam before the Fall
    - c) Fallen man can only choose between evils unless they receive divine grace
- 8. Fall of Rome Is Not to Be Laid at the Door of the Christians
  - a. Forms of government do not interest him
  - b. Augustine's world was a bureaucratic empire
  - c. Deflation of Roman glory and *libertas*
- F. THE CITIZENS OF THE CITY OF GOD (169-173)
  - 1. The Two Cities
    - a. **City of God**: Those whom god by his grace has admitted
    - b. **Earthly city**: defined by exclusion
    - c. Conceptual entities
    - d. Election
    - e. We are all sinners
    - f. Voltaire vs. **Joseph de Maistre**
      - 1) Godless pride built into us at birth
      - 2) We should be grateful that God spared some
  - 2. We Mortal Spectators Cannot Know Who Is Saved
    - a. Political relations cannot be based on distinguishing the elect
    - b. Two famous arguments
      - 1) Christians must obey non-Christian rulers
      - 2) Hobbes: Christian commonwealth should be a government the same way as a non-Christian one
    - c. Donatus
      - 1) Their standard of election
  - 3. Condemnation of the **Donatists**
    - a. Exclusivism and forcible conversions
    - b. Sore trial to Augustine's spirit
    - c. Circumcellions
    - d. Sacrament is efficacious
    - e. Character of political leaders
  - 4. Mixed Quality of All Human Communities
    - a. Ascetics
    - b. Relationship of church and state
      - 1) Admonition
      - 2) Administrative duties
    - c. Pastoral care
    - d. Care for the unfortunate
  - 5. Rendering unto Caesar
    - a. Obedience in good conscience
    - b. Soldiers
    - c. Politics
    - d. **Passive disobedience**
    - e. **Conscientious objection**
    - f. Martyrdom
    - g. Allegiance to the emperor's cult
    - h. Rebellion prohibited
  - 6. Cicero by Contrast
    - a. Tyrannicides
    - b. Cicero's Republic is worthy of respect
    - c. But early states are the playground of violent and self-deluded men
- G. POLITICS AS A LIMITED GOOD (173-175)
  - 1. The World is God's Creation; To Despise It Is Blasphemous



- a. Classical philosophy's contempt for the body
- b. Curiosity about the body
- c. Concern with deceit, malice and brutality
- 2. Disunity of mind and body
  - a. Victims of rape are not to be shunned
  - b. Rape and suicide of **Lucretia**
  - c. **Suicide** as murder
- 3. Purpose of the Earthly Kingdom
  - a. Promote peace
  - b. Worldly goods are not to be despised
  - c. Early success and failure have earthly causes
  - d. Success of Rome was not something to glory in
  - e. Property
  - f. Laws governing *meum et tuum* [me and you]
- 4. Such a Regime Cannot Achieve Ultimate Justice
  - a. Attention to long-run welfare is to be valued
  - b. We must not neglect ourselves
  - c. Man must not be taken away from the worship of the true God
  - d. But earthly justice is better than injustice
- 5. Imperial Rome
  - a. Driven by **libido dominandi** [lust to rule]
  - b. Imperial ambition is self-destructive folly
  - c. Small states
  - d. Just wars
- H. THE STATE, PUNISHMENT, AND JUST WAR (176-
  - 1. Coercive powers of the state
    - a. Two **purposes of punishment**
      - 1) Its threat gives a motive to behave better
        - a) Our fallen nature requires regulation
      - 2) Punishment may reform the criminal
        - a) Opposition to the death penalty
        - b) Punishment should be educative
  - 2. Arguments against **Capital Punishment**
    - a. Barbarity of Rome in Executions
      - 1) Torture: "put to the question"
      - 2) Privilege of a citizen
    - b. Judge's task
      - 1) Lack of certainty
    - c. Innocence
    - d. Judges conscience
  - 3. Augustine's Was Not the Modern Humanitarian Impulse
    - a. Hangman and soldier as God's instruments
    - b. Inescapability of corporal and capital punishments
    - c. Suffering of the innocent
  - 4. **Just War**
    - a. Modernity rejects the state's right to punish other states
    - b. Self-defense is a legitimate casus belli
    - c. Preemptive attacks
    - d. Question of collective guilt
      - 1) Due precaution is still required
  - 5. Motivation of a Just War
    - a. Punishment due to an aggressor
      - 1) Roman tendency to manufacture a casus belli
    - b. Augustine's awkward position
      - 1) Reminder of our limited capacity to determine just deserts
  - 6. Augustine's Emphasis on Sin

- a. Cicero
  - b. Hobbes
  - c. Doctrine of **original sin**
    - 1) Its realistic framework
  - d. Terrors in the absence of government
    - 1) Hobbes's preemptive strike
7. For **Thomas Hobbes**, the Vicious Circle Is Broken by Government
- a. Removal of threat and fear
  - b. Augustine cannot stop there
    - 1) Our problem: that we suffer from surplus motivation to ward theft and violence
    - 2) Our **self-will** is the problem
    - 3) **State only counteracts** rather than cures it
8. Earthly City Is Driven by the Love of Earthly Things [cf. Mimetic Desire]
- a. Well-ordered at best
  - b. Machiavelli and Rousseau longed for an idealized version of Cicero's republic
  - c. **Jean-Jacques Rousseau's** romantic nonsense likens a well-ordered absolute monarchy to a silent graveyard [Alexander Pope was more practical: "For Forms of Government let fools contest; whatever is best administered is best"]
9. Politics Should Be Left to the Powers That Be
- a. Dangerous degree of non-resistance
  - b. Hobbes
  - c. **John Locke's doctrine of resistance**
  - d. Cicero's death to tyrants
  - e. Hobbes's secular view
  - f. Augustine does not rely on a right of self-defense
10. Augustine Did Not Give a Defense of the Divine Right of Kings or of Theocracy
- a. Rulers are part of God's providential order
  - b. State as a band of robbers in the absence of justice
  - c. Cicero's track: True state is based on justice
11. States as **Magna Latrocinia** [Large Bands of Robbers, cf. Bastiat's Legal Plunder]
- a. Nazi regime vs. liberal democracies
  - b. The nature of states: legal plunderers [cf. Jesus on the Mammon of unrighteousness]
12. States Are Organizations Built to Allow Passions to Be Satisfied with a Minimum of Disorder
- a. Place of the threat of punishment
  - b. General truth of this proposition
  - c. Rulers must be obeyed as rulers, not because they are good men
  - d. Deficiency of this view in the face of Hitler and Stalin
13. Potential for liberty and toleration inherent in his ideas
- a. His handling of the Donatists
    - 1) His exasperation
14. Task of the State Is to Care for Externals
- a. Deep matters must be settled elsewhere
  - b. Force is not an argument
  - c. Soil that nourished the Protestant conception of toleration
15. Augustine as Heir to the Pagans Who Feared Divine Retribution
- a. He did not put the church off-limits to state control
  - b. Modern idea of toleration was more than a thousand years away
  - c. Church had not become the beneficiary of imperial protection
16. Dangerous Novelty: Extending Coercion to the Suppression of Heresy
- a. It allowed Christians to persecute each other with a clear conscience
  - b. Possible incongruities
  - c. It became a part of Christian orthodoxy
    - 1) *Cogere intrare*

## d. Dangerous legacy

**Review**

Manichaeen hearer	central Christian doctrines	<i>perfecti</i>
Neoplatonists	<i>Scipio's Dream</i>	two claims
Plotinus	evil as privation	pride and approval
City of God	earthly city	Joseph de Maistre
Donatists	passive disobedience	conscientious objection
Lucretia	suicide	<i>libido dominandi</i>
purposes of punishment	capital punishment	just war
original sin	Thomas Hobbes	self-will
the state counteracts sin	Jean-Jacques Rousseau	John Locke's doctrine of resistance
<i>magna latrocinia</i>		

**PREFACE TO PART II****Outline**

- A. TRANSITION TO MEDIEVAL POLITICAL THOUGHT (187-191)
1. Augustine as the End of Classical Political Thinking
    - a. Roman decline in the west
    - b. Justinian
    - c. **Cicero** was Augustine's polemical target
    - d. He criticized the Roman conception of politics
  2. Catholic Christianity as the **Unifying Force**
    - a. Warlord kings
    - b. Papacy inherited the **imperial idea of the state**
    - c. Transmission of Roman conceptions to medieval Europe
  3. Secular Political Development
    - a. William the Conqueror
    - b. Feudal levy of military service
    - c. Otto I
  4. Cleavage between Medieval and Modern Views
  5. The Political Arena Is a Place that Displays the *Libido Dominandi*
    - a. David Hume
    - b. Bertrand Russell
    - c. Sigmund Freud
    - d. Augustine was unblinkered [realistic]
  6. Augustine's View That Human Nature Is Fallen
    - a. Devaluation of earthly politics
  7. Contrast with Classical Political Philosophers and Historians
    - a. Modern liberalism
    - b. Incomplete devaluation of politics
    - c. Pilgrims
    - d. Near antinomianism
  8. Recovery of Ancient Literature and Philosophy
    - a. Revival of the classical city-state
    - b. Rise of the modern, bureaucratically managed monarchical state

**Review**

Cicero	Christianity as unifying force	imperial idea of the state
--------	--------------------------------	----------------------------

## CHAPTER 6: BETWEEN AUGUSTINE AND AQUINAS

### Outline

- A. DID MEDIEVAL POLITICAL THEORY EXIST? (193-95)
1. Impact of Christianity on Ideas about Politics
    - a. Focus on issues
    - b. Rebirth of distinctly political thinking in **John of Salisbury**
    - c. Greeks and early Romans argued about *poleis*
      - 1) They did not speak the modern language of individual human rights
  2. Roman Empire
    - a. Principate of Caesar Augustus
      - 1) Only one political model, **monarchy**, was left in command of the field
    - b. **Virtual deification** of the Christian emperors [which makes the confrontation of Emperor Theodosius by Ambrose, the bishop of Milan, so important]
      - 1) Papacy also copied the thrones, tiaras, and robes of the Roman Empire
    - c. College of Cardinals replaced the Senate
    - d. Papacy in the West
    - e. Question of the relationship between church and state
  3. Thinkers Still Drew on Second-Hand Classical Philosophy
    - a. No direct knowledge of Plato or Aristotle until 12C
      - 1) Modern political institutions have their roots in medieval practice, but we think about them in ways borrowed from the Greeks and Romans
    - b. Roots of modern **representative government** actually lie in medieval systems of legal administration and military recruitment [see Harold Berman and John Witte]
      - 1) **Feudalism** had a prehistory in older forms of tribal organization
      - 2) Medieval representation of places and groups [geographic constituencies are still represented, but the “one man, one vote” principle was injected through *Baker v. Carr* (1962) and other reapportionment decisions]
    - c. British parliamentary government evolved from a **king and council system**
    - d. US inserted the English representative system into the framework of a Ciceronian republic
    - e. The Polybian view of mixed government aligns easily with the medieval king and council system
      - 1) Consent for taxation from a body representing the “commons”
    - f. Ancient leagues for mutual defense were similarly representative
- B. MEDIEVAL CONCEPTIONS OF AUTHORITY (195-98)
1. Ascending and Descending Theories of Authority
    - a. Feudal institutions combined both conceptions
    - b. Republican institutions
    - c. Justinian
  2. One-Man Rule Prevailed from 476-1945
    - a. Italian and Adriatic city-states
    - b. **Charlemagne** (Karl or Carol the Great), 800: Emperor of the Romans
    - c. Otto I, 962: Holy Roman Emperor
    - d. Forcible unification of Germany by Prussia, 1870
  3. Subordinate Institutions
    - a. **Marsilius** of Padua
      - 1) Descending theory of government
  4. The Imperial Cult
    - a. Diocletian [beginning of the Tetrarchy: rule by two Augusti and two Caesars]
    - b. Constantine [son of Constantius, the western Caesar] and his successors
      - 1) Elaborate stage machinery [including a throne that could be elevated]

- 2) Emperor *Dei gratia* [by the Grace of God]
- 3) *Rhum* [also the name used by Muslims]
- c. Sicily
- d. Lombards
- e. Two Roman Empires: Eastern (Byzantine) and Western (Carolingian, Ottonian)
- 5. Dismemberment of the Byzantine Empire
  - a. Coronation of Charlemagne in the West
  - b. Holy Spirit
  - c. Final rift in 1054
- 6. Church and State
  - a. Supremacy of the Byzantine emperor
  - b. Imperial and royal meddling in the West was an exception
  - c. Papacy's aim was to preserve its freedom
- C. PASSIVE OBEDIENCE AND POLITICAL OBLIGATION: WHO JUDGES? (198-202)
  - 1. Christian View of Political Authority
    - a. Saint Paul: Obedience for conscience's sake
    - b. Augustine
    - c. Classical value of self-sufficiency
      - 1) Christian critique
  - 2. The Powers That Be Are Divinely Ordained
    - a. Augustine: Respect the office
    - b. Question of when or when not to obey
    - c. **Passive disobedience**
    - d. Question of martyrdom
  - 3. Duty to Kings Who Do Not Attack the True Faith
    - a. Who is to judge that a ruler lacks God's warrant?
    - b. Papal **interdicts**
      - 1) John
      - 2) Elizabeth
  - 4. **Tyrannicide**
    - a. Classical Roman view
    - b. Spheres of authority
    - c. Plot to kill Hitler
    - d. Private individuals were not to make that judgment
    - e. Locke broke with this tradition
  - 5. Who Judges?
    - a. Accountability to a lay body
    - b. Germanic tradition
    - c. Feudal authority based on consent
    - d. The barons of **Magna Carta**
- D. POPES AND KINGS (202-04)
  - 1. Place of the Church
    - a. The power to bind and loose
    - b. Reproving sovereigns
      - 1) Theodosius and Ambrose
    - c. Authority of the pope to depose kings *ratione peccati*
    - d. The argument can cut two ways
    - e. Shared authority
    - f. Diocese
  - 2. Constitutional Case for Removal from Office
    - a. Ignored through much of history [e.g., the *Saeculum Obscurum* or Portnocracy, 904-964, was a low point in the papacy]
    - b. Difficulties with respect to the papacy
      - 1) **Theory of papal authority**
      - 2) *Plenitudo potestatis* of St. Peter
      - 3) Contrast with the secular nobility's interest in constitutional monarchy

- E. NATURAL LAW AND CONVENTIONAL LAW (204-07)
1. Medieval Legal History
    - a. Sources of Law
    - b. God as lawgiver
    - c. Medieval view of law
      - 1) Slavery and property
    - d. **Natural law**
      - 1) Aristotle
      - 2) Custom
      - 3) Natural equality
  2. Authority of Local Law
    - a. Suttee
    - b. Two views
      - 1) Justinian's **Corpus juris civilis**: Ruler's will as autocrat
      - 2) Sovereign legislator: person or larger body
  3. Corpus Juris Civilis
    - a. Commentators recorded what they believed to be the traditional Roman view of law
    - b. Cicero: *Lex naturae* and *ius gentium*
    - c. How they are differentiated
  4. *Ius Civile*
  5. Jus Gentium
    - a. Law of nature
    - b. Features of unwritten international law
    - c. Capture of prisoners in a just war [cf. Hugo Grotius]
  6. Are All Creatures Governed by Natural Law?
    - a. Aristotle
    - b. Roman commentators
      - 1) **Ulpian**
- F. THE ORIGINS AND JUSTIFICATION OF PRIVATE PROPERTY (207-12)
1. Expectation of an Imminent Second Coming of Christ
    - a. Simple form of communism [Some interpreters see this practice as local due to the rapid growth of the Christian community, temporary, and not binding]
    - b. Property ownership by churches and monasteries
    - c. Papacy
    - d. Questions about the nature of property and private ownership
    - e. Slavery employed by early churches
    - f. Labor but not slavery was a part of monastic life [The Benedictine monasteries reclaimed land and laid the foundations of Christendom; see Erik von Kuehnelt-Leddihn's *Timeless Christian*]
    - g. Need for criminal law
  2. Acquisition and Transfer of Property
    - a. **Duty of haves to have-nots**
    - b. Christ's admonition
    - c. St. Paul on the love of money
    - d. Christian economics
  3. Less Agreement on the Nature of Ownership
    - a. *Ius in rem* vs. *ius ad personam*
    - b. Ownership is good against all the world
    - c. Owner in Roman law is sovereign over the thing owned
  4. Ownership Is Less Clear-Cut under Feudal Conditions
    - a. Chain of tenant and lord terminated in the suzerain: King as feudal superior
    - b. Rights of disposal
      - 1) **Fee** [of which there were different types]
      - 2) Rights of use and occupation
  5. Vulnerability of Title

- a. Title companies
  - b. Duty of the rich to share their resources with the poor during times of hardship
  - c. John Locke and David Hume
  - d. Property owned by the church
- Tithes and gifts
- 6. Church Property
    - a. Corporate ownership
      - 1) Bishops and deacons
    - b. Publicly owned property
    - c. Gifts deprived the layman's feudal overlord of the "incidents" of ownership
  - 7. The Immortal Church
    - a. Temptation to "sharp" practice [enjoyment of personal benefits from donations]
    - b. Tithes
    - c. Exemption of the property of charities from ordinary taxation
  - 8. These Issues Poisoned Church-State Relations for Centuries
    - a. Germans
    - b. **Statute of Mortmain**
    - c. Stoic philosophers contended that property was originally held in common [cf. Karl Marx's idea of primitive communism]
    - d. Private property as an incentive for stewardship [cf. Garrett Hardin's argument about "the tragedy of the commons"]
    - e. Overarching notion of the common good
- G. OUTSIDE (NON)INFLUENCES (212-15)
- 1. Collapse of the Western Roman Empire
    - a. Germanic invasions
    - b. Rise of **Islam**
      - 1) Crusades
      - 2) Spanish **Reconquista**
      - 3) Ottoman Empire
      - 4) Instability of the successor states that emerged from the Ottoman ruins
    - c. Islam as a creed had no impact on western political thought
    - d. Islam had no place for the sacred/secular distinction
  - 2. Military Impact of Islam
    - a. Battle of Poitiers [Tours], 732
    - b. North African conquests were not reversed
    - c. Greece and the Balkans
  - 3. Conversion or Death
    - a. Toleration of Jews and Christians as **peoples of the book** [the protected *dhimmi* status required payment of the *jizya*]
    - b. **Millet system** [Ottoman system under which Muslims were governed by *Shari'a*, Christians under canon law, and Jews under *Halakah* law]
    - c. Islamic pluralism
      - 1) Islamic philosophers [*Falasifa*]
      - 2) **Ibn Khaldun** presaged Robert Michels' theory of the circulation of elites
  - 4. Jewish Scholars
    - a. Preservation of classical masterpieces
    - b. Transmission of medical and mathematical knowledge
    - c. Diaspora Jews as barely tolerated outcasts
      - 1) Conduit of Neoplatonic ideas
      - 2) Idea of the **great chain of being** [cf. Arthur O. Lovejoy]
    - d. Aquinas's synthesis
- H. PAPAL ABSOLUTISM AND THE INVESTITURE CONTROVERSY (215-19)
- 1. Pope **Gelasius I**
    - a. The last Western emperor had abdicate 16 years earlier
    - b. Gelasius's letter to the Eastern emperor Anastasius, 494
      - 1) **Doctrine of the two swords**

- 2) Anticipation of sphere sovereignty [Abraham Kuyper]
- 2. Two Powers
  - a. Quid pro quo
  - b. Concordat
  - c. Denial of the emperor's authority and assertion of papal authority
- 3. Institutional Conflict Remained Latent until the Mid-11C
  - a. Bishops were members of the feudal nobility [America's Protestant Establishment of much of the 20C was a survival of this old class system]
  - b. Two practices
    - 1) Creation of **proprietary churches**
    - 2) **Lay investiture**
- 4. Founding and Refounding of Monasteries
  - a. Sin of **simony** [after Simon Magus, Acts 8] [This is a form of "rent-seeking"]
  - b. Papal tiara was often bought and sold
  - c. Monastic reform movement [cf. Eugen Rosenstock-Huessy, *Out of Revolution*, pp. 529-37]
- 5. Three Papal Aims
  - a. Papal election only by the **College of Cardinals**
    - 1) Lateran Council called by Nicholas II
    - 2) Conflict of Gregory VII and Henry IV marked a paradoxical finale to a reform process begun by emperor Henry III]
    - 3) Council of Sutri, 1046
    - 4) Henry III intervened but also sought to uphold lay investiture
  - b. Elimination of lay investiture
    - 1) Confrontation at **Canossa**, 1077 [Henry stood barefoot in the snow as a penitent for three days in the dead of winter in front of the castle of Matilda of Tuscany, where Gregory was staying]
    - 2) **Concordat of Worms**, 1122
  - c. Secure the primacy of the Catholic Church in Christendom
    - 1) Final breach with Eastern Orthodoxy, 1054
- 6. Other Issues
  - a. Practicing lawyers helped define the ways superiors and inferiors interrelated
  - b. First Parliament, 1265
  - c. Conciliar movement
  - d. Occasional outbursts of intellectual creativity
- I. JOHN OF SALISBURY (219-23)
  - 1. *Policraticus*
    - a. John's background
      - 1) **Thomas à Becket**
      - 2) Reliance on *florilegia* [anthology; lit. a collection of flowers]
  - 2. Book of the Statesman
    - a. **Christine de Pizan**
    - b. Reliance on example
    - c. Tyrannicide
    - d. Tension between authority wielded *Dei gratia* and as the expression of the vox populi
    - e. England: realm *regale et politicum*
    - f. *Corpus mysticum*
  - 3. Difference between a King and a Tyrant
    - a. Augustine
  - 4. True King
    - a. God's conferral of authority is conditional
    - b. People do no wrong if they resist a tyrant
    - c. Cicero
  - 5. John Was Not Trying to Resurrect Roman Ideals
    - a. Old Testament examples



- b. Saul as a deserved affliction
- c. Milder and more moderate than the Roman tyrannicides
- d. Rise to constitutionalism
- e. King is **legibus absolutus** with sovereign immunity and is exempted from the law he gives [Congress follows this practice contrary to *Federalist*, no. 57]
- 6. John Is Torn between the Christian Tradition of Passive Obedience and the Classical Tradition of Tyrannicide
  - a. Approval of just slaying of tyrants
  - b. Tyrants forfeit their immunity to deposition [impeachment]
  - c. Application to clerical leaders
- 7. Conditionality of Both Secular and Ecclesiastical Authority
  - a. Medieval way of life is not wholly inscrutable to us

## Review

John of Salisbury	monarchy	virtual deification
representative government	feudalism	king and council system
Charlemagne	Marsilius	passive disobedience
interdicts	tyrannicide	Magna Carta
theory of papal authority	natural law	<i>corpus juris civilis</i>
Ulpian	duty of haves to have-nots	fee
Statute of Mortmain	Islam	<i>Reconquista</i>
peoples of the book	millet system	Ibn Khaldun
great chain of being	Gelasius I	doctrine of the two swords
proprietary churches	investiture	simony
College of cardinals	Canossa	Concordat of Worms
Thomas à Becket	Christine de Pizan	<i>legibus absolutus</i>

## CHAPTER 7: AQUINAS AND SYNTHESIS

### Outline

- A. THE REVIVAL OF PHILOSOPHY (224-226)
  - 1. Rediscovery of Classical Legal and Political Thought
    - a. Impact on Christian political thinking
      - 1) Augustine's empire had only recently been Christianized
      - 2) Europe of Aquinas was Christendom
        - a) Spiritual, not political, unity
  - 2. Aquinas's Attempted Synthesis of the Classical and the Christian
    - a. Aristotle condemned in 1270
    - b. Aquinas's sensible approach
    - c. Contrast with Augustine
  - 3. Literary Style of the ***Summa Theologiae***
    - a. Aquinas's views set out as answers to questions
    - b. Later rejection of the scholastic style
    - c. Riskiness of Aquinas's ideas
- B. AQUINAS'S LIFE AND TIMES (226-228)
  - 1. Aristocratic Family
    - a. Benedictine monastery at Monte Cassino
    - b. Dominicans
  - 2. Studies with Albertus Magnus
    - a. The ox
    - b. *Licentium docendi*
    - c. *Summa contra Gentiles*

3. Activities
  4. **Dominican Order**
    - a. *Canis Domini*
    - b. Order of Preachers
      - 1) Preachers of crusades
    - c. Linguistic studies
- C. INTELLECTUAL LIFE IN THIRTEENTH-CENTURY EUROPE (228-230)
1. University of Paris
    - a. Study of Roman law
    - b. Bologna
    - c. Communities of scholars
    - d. Bachelor's degree
    - e. **Master of arts** and the *licentium docendi*
    - f. All study was vocational
  2. Theology: Queen of the Sciences
    - a. Fear of exposure to pagan thought
    - b. So-called Dark Ages
  3. Classical Thought
    - a. Neoplatonism
    - b. Plato's *Timaeus*
    - c. Peter Lombard's *Sentences*
    - d. Isidore of Seville
    - e. Aristotle
  4. Translations
    - a. William of Moerbeke
- D. REASON VERSUS REVELATION: FAITH AND PHILOSOPHY (230-232)
1. Importance of Meta-Physical and Religious Questions
    - a. Aristotle's metaphysics
      - 1) Political difficulties for a Christian
    - b. Greater congeniality of Platonic myths
  2. Christianity
    - a. Historical, particularistic creed
    - b. Unanswerable questions about God's motivation
  3. Aquinas's Nuanced Approach
    - a. Grace perfects nature
    - b. Use of reason in its proper sphere
  4. Claims of Faith and Reason Held in Balance
  5. Ethics and Politics Have a Doubly Subordinate Place
    - a. Aquinas's chief topic: Nature of God and creation
    - b. Practical knowledge admits of limited certainty
    - c. Aquinas left no work entirely devoted to politics
- E. THE POLITICAL BACKGROUND: CHURCH AND EMPIRE (232-236)
1. Church vs. Empire
    - a. **Frederick II** and Innocent IV
    - b. Territorial and financial causes of the conflict
      - 1) Papal States
      - 2) Allegiance of allies depended on bribery and coercion
    - c. Earlier vision of two spheres
  2. "Ascending" Theories of Authority
    - a. Cicero
  3. Resonance with Italian City-States
    - a. Venetian Republic
    - b. Leo III (not Sylvester) and the Coronation of Charlemagne
    - c. Donation of Constantine
    - d. Lombards
    - e. Kingdom of Sicily

4. Imperial Weakness
    - a. Dissensions of the German electors
    - b. **Innocent III** [to whom King John appealed to retract Magna Carta]
    - c. Frederick
    - d. Plans to unify Italy
  5. Further Threats to the Papacy's Independence
    - a. Jean Bodin
      - 1) Sovereign state
    - b. Capetian monarchy in France
    - c. **Philip IV**, the Fair
    - d. Edward I Longshanks
- F. AQUINAS'S POLITICAL THEORY (236-240)
1. Objective: Synthesis and Summary of Theology and Philosophy
    - a. Property
      - 1) Franciscan criticism of wealth
    - b. Forms of political authority
  2. Political Importance of Religion
    - a. Concern with the religious practices of subjects
    - b. Religious diversity
    - c. Frederick II
  3. Christian Natural Law Distinctives: Tensions with Other Views
    - a. Classical view
      - 1) Golden age
    - b. No classical counterpart to the fall
    - c. Gracious personal god
    - d. Stoic doctrine of **apatheia**
      - 1) No place for grace
  4. Questions of Natural Inequality
    - a. Aristotle vs. Christianity
    - b. Stoicism
  5. Relations of Nature and Convention
    - a. Defense of private property
    - b. Aristotelian teleology
      - 1) Concept of "flourishing" plants
  6. The State
    - a. Sin required it
      - 1) Well-ordered state helps us lead better lives
    - b. We are enabled to lead the good life in common
  7. Monarchy: the best form of government
    - a. Aristotle's *politeia*
    - b. Democracy preferred to tyranny for its efficiency
  8. Whether or Not the State Exists by Nature
    - a. Adam as a patriarch
    - b. Aquinas's acceptance of a natural hierarchy
- G. THE VARIETIES OF LAW (240-44)
1. Taxonomy
    - a. **Eternal law** of reason
      - 1) Principle of practical reason in the lawgiver
    - b. **Natural law**
      - 1) Rational for man
      - 2) Analogical for animals
      - 3) Simple and universal precepts
      - 4) Golden Rule
      - 5) Role of casuistry
  2. Different Forms of the Law
    - a. Divine positive law

- 1) Old law
    - 2) New law
      - a) Its singularity vs. its plurality
  - 3. Eternal Law Serves as a Standard
    - a. It is silent on money issues that divine positive law addresses
    - b. New law contains natural law
    - c. First principles are immutable but not secondary principles
  - 4. Question of Law's Authority
    - a. Medieval view: Two possibilities held in tension
      - 1) Descending vs. ascending conception of authority
  - 5. Question of How Far Natural Law Constrains the Legitimacy of Human Law
    - a. Distinction between general rules and specific requirements
  - 6. Indispensable role of human law in a fallen world
    - a. Purpose of human law is to make man act virtuously
  - 7. Need for Coercive Law
    - a. Aquinas does not appeal to law as a tool to assist economic activity
    - b. Utility of self-sufficiency
  - 8. Authority of Law
    - a. Unjust laws lose their authority
    - b. We should aim to have "enough"
- H. THE VIRTUES OF PRIVATE PROPERTY (244-4&0)
  - 1. Morality of Private Property
    - a. Franciscans
    - b. Dominicans
    - c. *Amor habendi* (desire for possessions)
  - 2. Legitimacy of Private Ownership
    - a. God's sovereignty
    - b. Dominion over inferior creatures
    - c. Efficiency of private property
    - d. Common property breeds dissension [cf. Garret Hardin's tragedy of the commons]
  - 3. Private Property and Common Use
    - a. Aristotle: Spartan military messes
    - b. Aquinas: Sharing in time of need
  - 4. Essence of Property
    - a. Theft is transparently wrong
    - b. Pragmatic argument: The possessions of the rich are essential to the poor
  - 5. Times of Famine
    - a. Superfluities of the rich "belong" to the starving poor
    - b. Mankind reverts to a state of nature in extreme necessity
- I. WAR (247-48)
  - 1. Wars between States
    - a. Question of what entitles us to cause the deaths of other human beings
    - b. **Prerequisites for just war**
      - 1) It must be official
      - 2) Just cause: self-defense
        - a) Pre-emptive strike
        - b) Recovering unjustly seized territory
      - 3) Right intentions
  - 2. Role of the Clergy
    - a. Bishops with Secular Authority
    - b. Warlike tasks distract from clerical duties
- J. THE STATE AND CHRISTIANITY (248-54)
  - 1. Where Aristotle Stops
    - a. Heresy
      - 1) Modern ideal of toleration

2. Role of the Christian Polity
    - a. Safeguarding the Church
    - b. Following the guidance of the Church in moral matters
    - c. Clerical immunity from criminal prosecution
    - d. Authority over Jews
    - e. **Ratione Peccati** [intervention when grave moral issues are raised]
  3. Separation of Jurisdictions of Church and State Was Not Asserted
    - a. 17C ideas of toleration
    - b. 13C ideas of distinguishable jurisdictions
    - c. Christian ruler promote virtue
    - d. Authority of the church in doctrinal matters
    - e. Everyone should stick to one job [cf. Plato]
  4. Right of Unbelievers to Exercise Authority over Christians
    - a. Authority of the pagan Roman Empire
    - b. General obedience
    - c. Augustine: Passive disobedience of unjust rulers
    - d. Aquinas: Unjust ruler forfeits right to obedience
      - 1) Result: Reversion to a state of nature [cf. John Locke]
  5. Question of Heretics
    - a. Faith must come willingly
      - 1) Tares and wheat
      - 2) Injunction *compelle intrare* [Compel them to come in]
      - 3) Nonbelievers should be stopped from subverting the faith
    - b. Coercion
      - 1) Milder forms of coercion work best
    - c. Punishment of heretics
    - d. Church's Self-Restraint
    - e. Deposition of rulers for apostasy
  6. Question of Jews
    - a. Canon law: Jews are slaves of the Church
    - b. Thomas's lack of interest in the conversion of Jews
    - c. Relapsed converts
    - d. Toleration of their rites
    - e. Exacting a tribute from the Jews
      - 1) Perpetual slaves
      - 2) Whatever is taken should be returned to those who paid usury
- K. **POLITEIA, KINGSHIP, TYRANNY (254-56)**
1. Defense of Moderate Monarchy
    - a. The common good is not additive [cf. Rousseau's general will]
    - b. **Mirror of Princes** [*Speculum principum*]
  2. Advice and Consent of the Nobles
    - a. Representative government
  3. **Deposition of Tyrants**
    - a. Removal must be an act of the community [cf. interposition by lesser magistrates]
      - 1) John Locke's appeal to heaven
    - b. Question of who may start the process
    - c. Superiority of the body that could dismiss the sovereign, which led to the
      - 1) Conciliar movement within the Church
      - 2) Revival of republic theory in Italian city-states
      - 3) Rise of modern representative democracy

## Review

*Summa Theologiae*  
Frederick II  
*apatheia*

Dominican Order  
Innocent III  
eternal law

master of arts  
Philip IV  
natural law

prerequisites for just war  
deposition of tyrants

*ratione peccati*

mirror of princes

## CHAPTER 8: THE FOURTEENTH-CENTURY INTERREGNUM

### Outline

- A. ROADS NOT TAKEN UNTIL LATER (257-258)
  - 1. **Conciliar Movement**
    - a. Church reform
    - b. Habsburgs abandoned the attempt to unify Italy
    - c. Subsequent attempts
    - d. Vision of a new roman empire died
  - 2. Scenes of the Reform Attempts
    - a. City-states
    - b. Conciliarist pressures for a constitutionally governed church
    - c. Protestant churches
  - 3. Subsequent Attempts at Empire
    - a. Napoleon
    - b. Hitler
    - c. European Union
    - d. Bartolus of Sassoferrato
    - e. Nicholas of Cusa
- B. CHURCH AND STATE (258-265)
  - 1. Conflict of Church and State
    - a. Desire of kings to tax the wealth of the church
    - b. Zero-sum game
      - 1) Disputes took on a sharper edge
    - c. Golden Bull of 1356
      - 1) Creation of seven imperial electors
  - 2. Binding and Loosing
    - a. Pippin the Short
    - b. **Marsilius of Padua** on the transfer of power
    - c. Pope Gelasius's two swords doctrine
    - d. Disputed issues
  - 3. Papacy Sank into Secular Impotence
    - a. Death of Frederick II
    - b. Innocent III: papal interdict on England
    - c. Philip IV
    - d. Avignon
  - 4. Hollow Victories of the Papacy
    - a. English kings after John
    - b. Taxes levied on the clergy
    - c. The Catholic Church's wasting assets
    - d. **Boniface VIII** went too far
  - 5. The Heart of the Weakness of the Papacy: Rome
    - a. Gaetani and Colonna families
    - b. Downfall of Boniface VIII
    - c. Papal states
  - 6. Decisive Defeat of the Papacy, 1303
    - a. Resignation of **Celestine V**
    - b. Boniface VIII
    - c. **Dante's Great Refusal**
    - d. [Benedict XVI became Pope Emeritus, 2013]

7. **Taxation of the Clergy**
    - a. *Clericis laicos*
    - b. *Unam sanctam*
    - c. Philip's retort
    - d. Boniface
  8. Boniface's Incaution
    - a. Bishop of Pamiers
      - 1) Privilege of clergy
    - b. Implication that the king was assuming jurisdiction over spiritual offenses
      - 1) The provocation
  9. *Ausculda Fili* [Listen, son]
    - a. Philip repudiated the pope's claims
    - b. Propaganda battle
    - c. Boniface disclaimed *fatuitas* [foolishness]
  10. *Unam Sanctam*
    - a. Supremacy of the spiritual power
    - b. Power to depose kings for *ratione peccati* [for reason of sin]
      - 1) Laid against Elizabeth I
    - c. Philip's council denounced the pope
  11. Philip's Strong-Arm Tactics
    - a. Guillaume de Nogaret
    - b. The Colonnas
    - c. Clement V
  12. Imperial Weakness
    - a. Imperial interregnum
    - b. Rudolf of Habsburg
    - c. Henry of Luxemburg
- C. DANTE (265-272)
1. The Divine Comedy
    - a. Prior of Florence
    - b. Black Guelphs
  2. Exile
    - a. Verona
    - b. *De monarchia*
  3. Argument for a Revived Empire on the Roman Model
    - a. **Universal empire** seen as a protective umbrella
    - b. Placement on the Index of forbidden books
  4. First Part Justifies Monarchy by the Light of Reason Alone
    - a. Rejection of the pope's legal and political superiority
  5. Anticipation of Kant, Hegel and Marx
    - a. Purpose of life in society: Manifest human perfections
    - b. Duty of rulers: Preservation of peace
    - c. Conditions of the good life: peace and justice
  6. Cosmopolitan Scope
    - a. All mankind is involved in this universal striving after perfection
    - b. Allegiance of a universal monarchy
  7. Role of God's Providence in History
  8. Augustine
    - a. Roman Empire's limited service to mankind
      - 1) "Doing the lesser evil to prevent the greater"
    - b. For lack of something better
    - c. God's will
  9. Dante Gave Government a More Positive Role
    - a. **Tutelary role**
    - b. Rome acquired power lawfully by right of combat
      - 1) Champions

- 2) Success as a mark of heaven's favor
- 10. Authority Given the Emperor Rather than the Pope
  - a. Donation of Constantine
  - b. Papal sovereignty over the papal states
  - c. Legal invalidity of the donation because of its corrupting effects
  - d. Emperor cannot alienate imperial authority
    - 1) Difficulties with this argument
- 11. Standard New Testament Exegesis
  - a. "Two swords" passage
    - 1) Gelasius's contortion of the passage
  - b. St. Peter's binding and loosing
  - c. *Plenitudo potestatis*
- 12. Special Position of Monarchy
  - a. Its moral superiority
  - b. Acceptability of all constitutional regimes
  - c. Priority of the political community
- D. MARSILIUS OF PADUA (272-279)
  - 1. Biographical Sketch
    - a. *Defensor pacis*
    - b. Education
  - 2. Theory of Secular Authority
    - a. Authority based on consent
    - b. Theory of representation
      - 1) *Cui bono?* [For whose benefit?]
    - c. Ludwig of Bavaria
    - d. Death of Henry of Luxemburg and the Civil War It Precipitated
  - 3. Negative Case against the Papacy's Role in Secular Politics
    - a. Consent of the governed
    - b. Council of Nicaea
  - 4. Marsilius's Innovation
    - a. Aristotelian Theory of Legitimacy Founded on Consent
  - b. Justinian
    - c. Donation of Constantine
    - d. *Vox populi, vox Dei*
  - 5. Object of the Political Community: a Self-Sufficient Life
    - a. Regnum
    - b. Civil happiness
      - 1) Papal threat
    - c. Functional components of a polity
    - d. Priestly function of a secular ruler
    - e. Beginning of institutional analysis
  - 6. Defense of Temperate Rule
    - a. Modern conception of limited government
    - b. Aristotelian teleological framework
    - c. Plenary power of government to do good
    - d. No areas where the law must be silent
  - 7. Representative Institutions and Systems of Election
    - a. Goal: Wise rule, not to keep government within bounds
    - b. Popes were elected but wielded *plenitudo potestatis*
  - 8. Idea of Election
    - a. **Popular consent** is the efficient cause [cf. Aristotle] of government
    - b. Continuing consent
    - c. Nearly everyone counts
  - 9. Argument for the *politeia*
    - a. Polyarchy (Robert Dahl)
    - b. The people



- 1) *Valentior pars*
    - c. Ludwig of Bavaria
    - d. Golden Bull
  - 10. Summary of the Argument
  - 11. Assault on the Political Power of the Papacy
    - a. St. Peter's power to bind and loose
- E. BARTOLUS AND THE ITALIAN CITY-STATE (279-287)
  - 1. Dependencies of Church or Empire
    - a. City-States of Lombardy
    - b. *Regnum Italicum*
    - c. Papal states
    - d. Papal vicar
  - 2. Nominal Imperial Overlordship
    - a. Rivalry and distrust among the cities
    - b. The popes' interest
    - c. Ideology: *Libertas*
    - d. Autonomy
    - e. evolved legal capacity
  - 3. Justinian's *Digest*: Emperor Is the World's Legitimate Lawmaker
    - a. Absurdity
    - b. Canon lawyers
  - 4. Cities Needed a Coherent Account of Their Legal Status
    - a. Claim to sovereignty
    - b. Reinvention of features of the early Roman Republic
      - 1) Consuls
      - 2) Contadini
    - c. Rise of feudal magnates
    - d. Negative effects of devices for preventing the rise of tyrants
  - 5. Council and Podesta
    - a. Double council
    - b. Problem of factionalism
    - c. Factional fights ending in one-man rule
    - d. Hereditary dukes
  - 6. Revival of Aspects of Ancient Political Life
    - a. Marsilius
    - b. Civil law and issues of legitimacy
    - c. Need for legal resolution
  - 7. **Bartolus** of Sassoferrato
    - a. Legal commentaries
    - b. Conflicted laws
    - c. True sovereign
    - d. Heirs of the *populus Romanus*
  - 8. Divided Sovereignty
    - a. Papal and imperial authority
    - b. Civil law vs. custom as a source of law
  - 9. *De Regimine Civitatis*
    - a. Autonomous city
    - b. Cicero's good king
    - c. **Unity of will** of one man
  - 10. Revival of *Politeia*
    - a. *Policratia*
    - b. Man with a solid stake in the city
    - c. Aristotelian forms of government
  - 11. Kingship by Election
    - a. Giles of Rome
  - 12. Anarchic Condition of Contemporary Rome

- a. A chaos of competing tyrants
- b. City prefect
- c. Absence of pope and cardinals
- 13. Possibility of "Legitimation of After the Event"
  - a. Conversion of tyrants into vicars of the church
- 14. Tyranny Acceptable in a Transitional Government
  - a. Question of the extent of legitimacy
- 15. Grounds for Justification
  - a. Prudential choice
  - b. Guelphs and Ghibellines
  - c. Mafia
- 16. Ambrogio Lorenzetti's Allegorical Paintings
  - a. Siena
  - b. Mixed metaphors
- F. CONCILIARISM AND OCKHAM (287-290)
  - 1. Conciliar Movement
    - a. Appalling state of the papacy in its Babylonian exile
    - b. Return to Rome, 1377-1378
    - c. Pope and antipope
    - d. The two sides in the schism
  - 2. Healing took Seven Decades
    - a. Representative government had to wait
    - b. Bureaucratically organized absolute monarchies strengthened
    - c. Question of where the authority to call a council lay
  - 3. Usable Sources
    - a. Marsilius
    - b. **William of Ockham**
      - 1) His skepticism that the church is a *corpus mysticum*
  - 4. The Councils
    - a. Pisa
    - b. Constance
      - 1) Jean Gerson
      - 2) Sigismund
      - 3) Hussite rebellion
    - c. Basel
      - 1) Nicholas of Cusa
      - 2) Borda count method
    - d. Return of the papacy to its autocratic and hierarchical style

### Review

Conciliar movement	Marsilius of Padua	Boniface VIII
Celestine V	Dante	Great Refusal
taxation of the clergy	universal empire	tutelary role of government
popular consent	Bartolus	unity of will
William of Ockham		

## CHAPTER 9: HUMANISM

### Outline

- A. WHAT WAS HUMANISM? (291-94)
  - 1. The Next Three Chapters Consider One Period of Time from Three Angles
    - a. Confessional divide between Protestants and Catholics

2. Commentators Are Divided on Humanism
    - a. Civic Humanism
      - 1) Florence and the revival of republican virtue
    - b. Establishment of reliable texts
      - 1) Textual criticism
    - c. Marsilius
    - d. Machiavelli
  3. Humanism Originated in the Need for Educated Lawyers
    - a. **Dictatores**
    - b. Education in humane letters
    - c. Literary and linguistic skills
  4. Italian Humanism vs. Northern European Humanism
    - a. Novelties
      - 1) Playful use of utopias
      - 2) Short polemical essay
    - b. Nonhumanist variants on its themes
    - c. Machiavelli's utopianism
  5. Literary Movement that Originated with Petrarch
    - a. Hostility to Scholasticism
    - b. Turn from Aristotle to spiritualized Platonism
  6. Identification of Humanists
    - a. **Pico della Mirandola**
    - b. Essayists, utopians, and poets (as opposed to Victoria)
    - c. Machiavelli: anti-Scholastic dubious humanist
    - d. Leonardi Bruni
- B. **CHRISTINE DE PIZAN** (294-99)
1. Her Rarity Value
    - a. Widowed at 24
    - b. Charles VI the Mad
    - c. Henry V at Agincourt, 1415
    - d. **Joan of Arc**
  2. Her Feminist Manifestos
    - a. *La querelle des femmes* [The Woman Question]
    - b. *The City of Ladies*
    - c. Practical knowledge and competence of women and the unlettered
  3. *The Book of the Body Politic*
    - a. Advice book to Louis of Guyenne
    - b. Other works
    - c. Imagery of the body politic
  4. Plato's Tripartite Division of the Soul and Its Virtues
    - a. Pizan changed the metaphor for the common people
    - b. Exhortation of the three estates
  5. Formula of the **Mirror of Princes**
    - a. Virtue and wisdom
    - b. Roman example
      - 1) *Exempla* of **Valerius Maximus** [Commonplace books and copybooks continued this tradition]
    - c. Cardinal virtues
    - d. Machiavelli's more disconcerting morals
  6. Four Attributes of the Book
    - a. Human touch
    - b. Criticism of the decayed state of the church
      - 1) Ferocity of her attack
      - 2) Great Schism
    - c. Sympathy with the common people
      - 1) But they have no political role

- 2) Obedience they owe their ruler
  - d. Un-Christian discussion of the virtues and obligations of the gentry
    - 1) Pagan and classical, Roman and republican examples
    - 2) Savagery of Roman behavior in battle
    - 3) Trickery and deception
    - 4) Hundred Years War
- C. LATER HUMANISTS: PICO'S ORATION (299-301)
- 1. Pico della Mirandola
    - a. The oration is a young man's work
    - b. Eclecticism
    - c. Hermes Trismegistus [Hermes Thrice-Majestic] [Hermetic tradition]
    - d. Chaldean theology and kabbalism
  - 2. **On the Dignity of Man**
    - a. Walter Pater
    - b. Self-creation
    - c. Condemned for heresy
  - 3. Pagan Creation Story Taken from Plato's *Protagoras*
    - a. Attributes of human intelligence
      - 1) Invention of political communities and practice of justice
    - b. Later romantics promoted self-perfection
    - c. But nevertheless inspired later utopians
      - 1) **Sir Thomas More**
  - 4. Theology
    - a. Forbidden to engage in public disputation
    - b. Making ourselves cherubim
    - c. Mysticism
- D. ERASMUS (301-11)
- 1. Background
    - a. Classical training
    - b. Monastic orders
    - c. Search for patrons
    - d. *Panegyric*
  - 2. **Education of a Christian Prince**
    - a. Mirror of Princes
      - 1) **Peace: The highest good**
    - b. His hatred of war
    - c. Sir Thomas More
    - d. Opposition to disgusting forms of execution
  - 3. Absolutism
    - a. Comparison with Marsilius
      - 1) **Popular consent** legitimizes government but does not limit it
    - b. Differentiation from tyrants
      - 1) Absolute princes govern the willing in the **general interest**
    - c. Good prince is like a Platonic guardian
  - 4. Plato's Revival
    - a. Marsilio Ficino's translation, 1469
    - b. More's *Utopia*
  - 5. Idea of the Philosopher/Prince
    - a. Hostility of the humanists toward the Scholastics
      - 1) A philosopher distinguishes reality from appearance and cleaves to the good
      - 2) Philosophy and Christianity conflated
  - 6. Public Opinion Is Not to be Trusted
    - a. Masses are in the grip of illusion
    - b. True happiness comes from the pursuit of virtue
  - 7. **Dangers of Flattery**

- a. Need to choose advisers wisely
  - b. Problem of venality [what Frederic Bastiat called legal plunder]
  - c. More's acquaintance with Plato's *Seventh Letter*
8. Two Crucial Dichotomies
- a. Difference between tyranny and legitimate rule
    - 1) Consent, not divine right, legitimizes rule
    - 2) Monarchy is the best form
    - 3) Tyrant depicted in animal imagery
    - 4) Tyrants govern in their own interest [again, legal plunder]
    - 5) Need for moderation in taxes
    - 6) Lawfulness is essential
    - 7) Tyrannicide is not praised
    - 8) But Erasmus does not repudiate a right of resistance
  - b. Peaceful vs. warlike prince
    - 1) How to pursue peace
    - 2) Arts of the statesman are the arts of peace [cf. Angelo Codevilla, *To Make and Keep Peace*]
    - 3) Admonition and persuasion are preferred to punishment
    - 4) **Law can encourage work**
    - 5) Charitable institutions
    - 6) Idleness associated with universities and the military
    - 7) Idle occupations as **seed-beds of crime** [gangs, soldiers, mendicants]
9. Century of Continuous Warfare
- a. Dynastic alliances
  - b. **Habsburg family**
  - c. Denunciation of the practice of **marital alliances**
10. Ferocity of His Condemnation of War
- a. Idea of a just war swept aside [Augustine's argument pointedly ignored]
  - b. *Complaint of Peace*, 1512
11. No Rights are Safe in a World of Continuous Warfare
- a. Prince cannot revenge himself on enemies without opening hostilities against his subjects [cf. Codevilla]
12. Why We Are So Inclined to Make War on Each Other
- a. Wars in Italy due to papal efforts to prevent a union
  - b. **Nationalism**
13. **The Praise of Folly**
- a. *Encomium Moriae*
  - b. Confusion over Erasmus' intentions
  - c. Its use as a pedagogical device
  - d. Masterpiece of double meaning
14. Folly speaks
- a. Masses are trapped in the flesh
    - 1) Plato's allegory of the cave
  - b. Christian "foolishness"
  - c. Question of whether either church or academy was needed
  - d. Modern liberal temper of mind
- E. SIR THOMAS MORE
- 1. An Enigmatic Figure
    - a. Tudor court
    - b. Speaker of the House
    - c. Lord chancellor
    - d. Conviction of treason
  - 2. His Readiness to Accommodate Himself to the Brutality and Duplicity of the court
    - a. He helped Henry VIII secure the title "Defender of the Faith"
  - 3. **Utopia**
    - a. Lucian's *True History*

- b. Plato's *Republic* for a later age
- 4. More's Political Ideals
  - a. Dislocation caused by the enclosure of commons for sheep runs
  - b. Savage penalties for theft and vagrancy [cf. later Black Acts]
  - c. Danger of unemployed soldiers
- 5. Running Critique of the Ills that Beset England
  - a. Sheep crowding out peasants and executions of unemployed men as thieves
  - b. Monarchs who rob their subjects to wage **predatory wars**
- 6. Main Features of Utopian Society
  - a. Gold used for chamber pots
  - b. William Morris [socialist]: *News from Nowhere*, 1890 [opposed to the state socialism of Edward Bellamy's *Looking Backward*; Samuel Butler's *Erewhon* (1872) has been likened to *Gulliver's Travels*]
  - c. Communist economy
  - d. Carthusian discipline
- 7. Labor under the discipline of the state
- 8. Work is a Discipline
  - a. Substantial equality is a dictate of justice
- 9. Denunciation of Capital Punishment for Theft
  - a. Thieves became slaves
  - b. **Edward Bellamy**
- 10. Critique of Nationalist and Commercial Rivalries
  - a. Institutions
  - b. Venice as a possible model
- 11. Religion
  - a. Toleration
- 12. Role of Priests in War
  - a. Preference to secure victory by deceit and bribery
  - b. Wars of national liberation, going beyond the UN Charter on regime change
  - c. Priests used to minimize destruction
  - d. Hiring mercenaries
  - e. Zapoletes
- 13. More's Detachment from the Politics and Religion of His Day
  - a. Dystopias
  - b. Comic elements
  - c. Ironic distance from reality
- 14. Almost Any Work Betrays Its Author's Intention
- F. **MONTAIGNE**
  - 1. Skepticism
    - a. His **essays** are essays of the self [He invented the form, an ancestor of the blog]
    - b. Man is a mystery to himself
  - 2. His Background
    - a. French civil wars
  - 3. First Modern Autobiography
  - 4. Conflict between the Private and Public

## Review

<i>dictatores</i>	Pico della Mirandola	Christine de Pizan
mirror of princes	Valerius Maximus	<i>On the Dignity of Man</i>
Sir Thomas More	Erasmus	<i>Education of a Christian Prince</i>
peace: the highest good	popular consent	general interest
dangers of flattery	law can encourage work	seed-beds of crime
Habsburg family	marital alliances	<i>The Praise of Folly</i>
<i>Utopia</i>	predatory wars	Edward Bellamy
Montaigne	essays	

## CHAPTER 10: THE REFORMATION

### Outline

- A. THE REFORMATION (321-23)
  - 1. No institutional divide among western Christians before 1500
    - a. There were several after 1550
    - b. Jan Hus and John Wyclif
    - c. "How are we to govern ourselves" takes on new urgency when religious differences are at stake
  - 2. **Great Schism**
    - a. Political hostility to the papacy
    - b. Confessional divide and national churches
    - c. political alliances made by the papacy
    - d. Readiness of secular authorities to take control over religious life
  - 3. **Henry VIII**
    - a. Catherine of Aragon
    - b. Piety
    - c. **Charles V**, Holy Roman Emperor and King of Spain
      - 1) Pope a virtual prisoner after the sack of Rome, 1527
    - d. Church of England
    - e. Two swords in the hands of one person
- B. PROTESTANTISM AND ANTINOMIANISM (323-26)
  - 1. Congregationalist Style of Church Governance and Liberal Democratic Politics
    - a. Britain and Netherlands
    - b. Denmark and Sweden
    - c. France
    - d. Venice
    - e. Spain
  - 2. Difficulty in Talking About the Political Impact
    - a. Protestantism initially involved a turning away from institutions of all kinds
  - 3. Impetus for the Late 15C Attacks on Prevailing Institutions
    - a. **Dissolution of the monasteries** was due to princely ambitions
      - 1) Only Italy and Spain refrained from inroads into church property [in fact, Charles V retired to the monastery at Yuste in 1556]
    - b. Henry VIII: Dissolution was the final episode in a prolonged budgetary crisis [Henry used the plunder to enrich his supporters, which strengthened the House of Commons against the lords]
    - c. Philip IV (the Fair) and his 14C assault on the fiscal privileges of the church [He deposed Pope Boniface VIII and moved the papacy to Avignon, beginning the so-called Babylonian Captivity]
    - d. Henry became head to secure his divorce from Catharine of Aragon
  - 4. The Term "Protestant"
    - a. **Diet of Speyer**, 1529: Protest against decrees of Charles V
      - 1) Evangelicals
    - b. Veneration of the vernacular Bible
      - 1) Close reading
  - 5. **Sola Scriptura**
    - a. Importance of the church as a corporation was undermined
    - b. John Locke's *Letter Concerning Toleration*, 1698
      - 1) Nature of the church's contract with the state
      - 2) Nature of toleration
      - 3) Dissent

6. Probable Result: Multiplication of Sects
    - a. **New England establishments**
      - 1) Connecticut [Massachusetts disestablished its congregational church in 1833, only to establish tax-supported public education four years later]
    - b. Radical anti-establishmentarianism
    - c. Protestantism is vulnerable to antinomianism
    - d. **Martin Luther** following Saint Paul: Salvation depends on God's grace and nothing else
  7. Inner Certainty
    - a. This may be delusive
    - b. Pure antinomianism
    - c. Luther: Sin boldly
      - 1) He later recoiled from what he had encouraged
    - d. Order imposed on chaos
  8. Vulnerability of Different Societies to **Antinomian Enthusiasm** ["Spirit-Filled" Lawlessness] Varied
    - a. Germany
    - b. England
    - c. **Millenarianism**
    - d. Precursors of today's mass suicides
    - e. Chiliastic myths [Chiliasm means 1000 year-ism; Otto III and Sylvester II were caught up in the enthusiasm around 1000 AD; Hungary produced a royal family of saints, beginning with King Stephen, whose feast good king Wenceslaus celebrated]
    - f. **Peasants' War** and **Thomas Müntzer**
    - g. **John of Leiden** in Münster
    - h. Savage put down
- B. LUTHER: LIFE AND TIMES; THEOLOGICAL PREMISES (327-31)
1. Accounts of His Life
    - a. Conflicting autobiographical accounts
    - b. Comparison with Augustine's *Confessions*
  2. Background
    - a. Brutal up-bringing
    - b. School was equally brutal
  3. **Ninety-Five Theses**
    - a. **Salvation by grace alone**
    - b. **Sale of indulgences**
      - 1) Morally dubious in the same way as state lotteries
    - c. Reformation Day, October 31, 1517
    - d. Ordination as priest, 1507
    - e. Professor of theology
  4. Luther was overworked
  5. External Provocations of Luther's Stand
    - a. Archbishop of Brandenburg
    - b. Posting theses
    - c. Pico della Mirandola
  6. Political Factors
    - a. **Frederick the Wise**
    - b. German knights
    - c. peasants
    - d. Friedrich Engels
  7. Reformation as a **Gutenberg Revolution** [Marshall McLuhan wrote about the *Gutenberg Galaxy*; Eugen Rosenstock-Huussy named the Reformation as the first in a series of secular revolutions in *Out of Revolution*]
    - a. 1,300 editions of Lutheran pamphlets in six years
    - b. Translation into the vernacular



- 1) **John Wyclif**
    - c. Use of print for propaganda purposes
    - d. Luther wrote for a mass audience
  - 8. Justification by Faith
    - a. It is not salvation by willed belief
    - b. We must reflect on the sacrifice made by Christ
    - c. It is not quietist mysticism
    - d. Strenuous engagement
    - e. Danger of detaching faith from grace
- C. POLITICAL THEORY (331-35)
  - 1. *Exsurge Domine*
    - a. Luther made a public bonfire of the papal bull
  - 2. **Address to the Christian Nobility of Germany**
    - a. Rejection of the sacrament of ordination
    - b. Baptism gives us a relationship to Christ and a duty to help others come to Him
    - c. Augustine's view
  - 3. Luther's Scything Attack Left Little Standing
    - a. Secular estates undercut
    - b. Canon law
    - c. State sponsored church
    - d. Attack on the monastic life
  - 4. Foundation for Secular Politics
    - a. Only one sword
      - 1) Problem of resistance to unjust rulers
    - b. Passive obedience
  - 5. Appeal to the Princes and the Emperor-Elect
    - a. Luther was blind to the alliances that saved his skin
    - b. Appeal for reformation by the secular authorities
      - 1) Hohenstaufen failure
    - c. *An Address's* polemic ad hoc technique
    - d. **Papacy's three lines of defense**
    - e. Luther's answer
      - 1) **Priesthood of all believers:** Division of labor is not a division of authority
      - 2) Every man is to read the Bible for himself
      - 3) Summoning the church councils
        - a) Institutions need the means of self-reform and need the help of secular authorities
        - b) Need for decentralization
- D. **ON SECULAR AUTHORITY** (335-40)
  - 1. Luther's Expressly Political Work
    - a. Comparative lack of Polemics
    - b. Emphasis on what not to do
    - c. Use of heavy irony
  - 2. Premise: Nearly Everyone Is Mistaken About Obedience
    - a. Princes think they are entitled to rule as they choose
      - 1) Their hypocrisy in justifying their commands as "required by the emperor"
      - 2) Excuse for over-taxation
    - b. People believe they must do as they are told
  - 3. Secular Authority Is Needed
    - a. Saint Paul: the powers that be are ordained
    - b. Christians are to serve as enforcers
    - c. Objection: "Resist not evil" (Matt. 5:39)
  - 4. Conundrum Concerning the Secular Sword
    - a. True Christians follow the path of justice for righteousness' sake
    - b. Unrighteous need coercion by the law

- c. Law is rightly imposed on all because all are tempted
- d. We should serve others
- e. A good man takes up the sword for the sake of others
- 5. Further Arguments
  - a. No role for coercion in matters of faith
  - b. Secular law maintained by external incentives
  - c. Spiritual law works in the heart
- 6. Compelling Belief
  - a. Thomas Hobbes' view
    - 1) Outward conformity suffices
  - b. Luther was unafraid of dissension in the early 1520's
  - c. Disagrees with Augustine's *compelle intrare*
- 7. Christian Prince
  - a. A very rare bird
  - b. Wicked rulers
    - 1) Duty to obey for sake of the right
    - 2) Refusal to assist them where they do wrong
- 8. Luther's Role in German Politics
  - a. Denunciation of the peasant wars
  - b. Open letter
  - c. Fear of Disorder
  - d. Attitudes toward Jews
- E. THE THEORY OF RESISTANCE
  - 1. Changed Views on Nonresistance
    - a. Passive Disobedience
    - b. Decent skepticism vis-à-vis Luther's responsibility for 20<sup>th</sup> C. horrors [*From Luther to Hitler* is the title of one sample of a whole mid-20C genre]
  - 2. Problems of a Literal Adherence to Luther's **Doctrine of Non-Resistance**
    - a. Intentions of Charles V
    - b. **John of Saxony**
    - c. Luther's lack of an institutional forum for deposing a tyrant
      - 1) Effect of giving away the spiritual sword
      - 2) Contempt for the traditions of natural and canon law
    - d. **Philipp Melanchthon**
  - 3. **Constitutionalist Position**
    - a. Resemblance to Locke's later view
    - b. Claim that positive law required princes to resist injustice
    - c. Difficulty of reconciling absolute authority with constitutional limitations
    - d. Medieval mind had resources for dealing with it
  - 4. Opening the Door to a **Theory of Resistance**
    - a. Ruler who uses unjust force abdicates his office
    - b. Constitutionalist claim
    - c. Lockean difficulty
    - d. Who is entitled to speak for the people?
  - 5. **Inferior Magistrates**
    - a. Estates General in France
    - b. Governing council
    - c. Movement toward a more overtly constitutionalist view of politics
  - 6. German Electors
    - a. Deposition of Emperor Wenceslaus
  - 7. Luther's Death, 1546
    - a. Schmalkaldic League
    - b. Battle of Mühlberg
    - c. Seeds of the Thirty Years War sown
    - d. Mary Tudor
    - e. Persecution of the French Huguenots [Protestants]

- f. Switzerland as a Protestant haven
- F. JEAN CALVIN
1. Urgency of the Threat to Protestants
  2. **John Calvin**
  3. ***Institutes of the Christian Religion***
    - a. Reluctance to open the door to popular uprisings
    - b. First obligation of civil government is to foster and protect worship
    - c. Christians are pilgrims
  4. Two Kingdoms
    - a. Michael Servetus
  5. **Ulrich Zwingli**
    - a. Zurich
    - b. Iconoclasm
    - c. Downfall
  6. Radical Tones Unleashed
    - a. Anabaptism
    - b. Heinrich Bullinger's influence in Elizabethan England
  7. **Classical Republican Idea**
    - a. No separation of church and state
    - b. Inferior magistrates
  8. Dangers of Resistance
  9. Tripartite Discussion of Civil Government
  10. When Resistance Is Required
- G. THE RADICALS
1. **Anabaptists**
    - a. Turn to pacifism after early violence
  2. Twofold Interest of the Anabaptists' Views
    - a. Economic distress provoked the Peasants' War, not political revolution
      - 1) Religious demands: Reduction of tithes, choice of own pastors
    - b. Lutheran Reformation gave the war its character
  3. Thomas Müntzer
    - a. Reliance on spiritual sense of the community [cf. Quaker sense of the meeting]
      - 1) Theory of popular sovereignty
      - 2) Ascending view of authority
    - b. Messianism: Expectation of an apocalyptic transformation
  4. Abandonment of the Institutional Church
    - a. Popular iconoclasm
    - b. Meetings in private homes [later called conventicles and made illegal]
  5. Little Opportunity to Develop a Coherent Political Vision
    - a. Focus on the need to develop a simple republican constitution
  6. **Schleitheim Articles**
    - a. Separation (withdrawal) from the world
      - 1) Adult baptism made a capital offense
    - b. Michael Sattler
      - 1) Radical pacifism
  7. **Balthasar Hubmaier**
    - a. Quietism
  8. John of Leiden and Bernard Knipperdolling
    - a. Münster, 1534-35
    - b. Jonestown [Heaven's Gate was another]
    - c. Melchiorite missionaries
  9. Vision of the New Jerusalem
    - a. Jan Matthys
    - b. Jan Bockelson [John of Leiden]
    - c. Fall of the city

## Review

Great Schism	Henry VIII	Charles V
dissolution of monasteries	Diet of Speyer	<i>Sola Scriptura</i>
New England establishments	Martin Luther	antinomian enthusiasm
Millenarianism	Peasants' War	Thomas Müntzer
John of Leiden	Ninety-Five Theses	salvation by grace alone
sale of indulgences	Frederick the Wise	Gutenberg Revolution
John Wyclif	<i>Address to the Christian Nobility</i>	papacy's three lines of defense
priesthood of all believers	<i>On Secular Authority</i>	doctrine of non-resistance
John of Saxony	Philipp Melanchthon	constitutionalist position
theory of resistance	John Calvin	<i>Institutes of the Christian Religion</i>
Ulrich Zwingli	classical republican idea	Anabaptists
Schleitheim Articles	Balthasar Hubmaier	

## CHAPTER 11: MACHIAVELLI

### Outline

- A. LIFE AND TIMES: THE POLITICAL CONTEXT (354-357)
  1. Family and Education
  2. Public Service and Diplomatic Missions
  3. **Florentine Militia**
    - a. Danger of mercenary troops
    - b. *Contadini* added to the *cittadini*
    - c. Pisa
  4. Demise of the Florentine Republic
    - a. Machiavelli's career and friendship
    - b. The Medici dukes
    - c. **Piero Soderini**
    - d. Assassination plot
  5. Publications
    - a. Art of War
    - b. The Prince
    - c. Papal Index
  6. Enforced Retirement
    - a. Discourses
    - b. Failed job application
    - c. Question of how Florence should be governed
- B. THE UNPLACEABILITY OF MACHIAVELLI (357-360)
  1. Elusive Thinker
    - a. Frederick the Great's view
    - b. Impact on political rhetoric
    - c. High-minded denunciations of Machiavelli
  2. Popular Image of Machiavelli as a "Teacher of Evil" [Leo Strauss]
    - a. Political surveys demands morally obnoxious acts
    - b. Contrast with stoicism
    - c. Reason of state
    - d. Murder of Remus by Romulus
  3. Tension between the Demand of Morality and Political Practice
  4. Author's Goal
    - a. Advice to a "new prince"
    - b. Unpopularity of the Medici
    - c. Whether corrupted republic can be restored

- d. Francesco Guicciardini's commission of the *La Mandragola* [Mandrake Root]
  - e. Leo X's commission of the History of Florence
- C. FLORENCE (360-364)
1. Popular Republic
    - a. *Libertas*
    - b. Populist theory, monarchical practice
    - c. Regimen regale
    - d. Danger of tyranny
    - e. Lorenzo the Magnificent
  2. Florence: Center of Intellectual Life
    - a. Great trading state
    - b. Its vulnerability
  3. Classical City-State Constitution
    - a. **Signoria**
      - 1) **Gonfaloniere** of justice
    - b. Committee of twelve good men
    - c. Committee of sixteen gonfalonieri
    - d. Other councils
    - e. Selection by lot
  4. Medici Rule
    - a. Cosimo de' Medici
    - b. Albizzi family
    - c. Hereditary uricemia
  5. Piero di Lorenzo
  6. **Girolamo Savonarola's** Republic of Virtue
    - a. Campaign against ecclesiastical corruption
    - b. Vulnerability to papal pressure
    - c. Savonarola's execution for heresy
  7. Grand Council
    - a. Unwieldiness
    - b. Italy's state of continuous upheaval
    - c. Role of the papacy
    - d. Sack of Rome
    - e. Brief restoration of the republic
- D. THE PRINCE (364-371)
1. Machiavelli's Observations
    - a. Lorenzo de' Medici as a new prince
    - b. Staying power of The Prince
  2. Timeliness
  3. Two Parts
    - a. Taxonomy of principalities
    - b. Periodic mirror of princes
  4. Machiavelli's New Advice
    - a. Ancient history as a quarry for examples of successful practice
    - b. Opening chapter
  5. Hereditary Principalities
  6. Chapter 3: Mixed Principalities
    - a. French bungled the job in Milan
    - b. Cultural differences
    - c. Roman experience
  7. What Is to Be Done?
    - a. Eliminate partisans of the deposed ruler (e.g. Machiavelli)
    - b. Live in the conquered territories
      - 1) Colonies of the Roman kind: self-sustaining
      - 2) Florence's problem
  8. Men Should Be Either Caressed or Crushed

- a. Roman assumptions
- 9. Territories Accustomed to Being Governed as Despotisms
  - a. Alexandrian Persia
  - b. Contrast: Greece under Antipater
  - c. Comparison with France
- 10. Conquered Republics
  - a. Three pieces of advice
  - b. Roman and Spartan morality
  - c. Spartans lost control of Athens and Thebes
  - d. Romans
  - e. How does one ensure that a conquest will take?
- 11. First Eleven Chapters
  - a. Fortuna
    - 1) Florentine superstition
    - 2) **Cesare Borgia**
- 12. **Virtù**
  - a. Heroes
  - b. **Armed prophets**
  - c. Savonarola: an **unarmed prophet**
- 13. Good Habits Need to Be Inculcated
  - a. Florentine ingratitude
  - b. Habits of obedience
  - c. Force creates acceptance
- E. THE PUZZLE OF CESARE BORGIA (371-374)
  - 1. Major Figure in Both Works
    - a. Literary tour de force
    - b. Lucrezia
    - c. Alexander VI
    - d. Captain general of the papal armies
  - 2. Papacy: Simultaneously Too Weak and Powerful
    - a. Dismissal of the papal vicars
    - b. Romagna
    - c. Julius II
    - d. Cesare's death
  - 3. Borgia's Tactical Cruelty
    - a. The Orsini
    - b. Senigallia
  - 4. Killing of Remirro de Orco
    - a. Kleptocrats of Romagna
    - b. Suppression of dissent
    - c. Regular court established
    - d. Object lesson
  - 5. Ecclesiastical Principalities
    - a. Incompetent administration
    - b. Rack and ruin
  - 6. **Alexander VI**
    - a. Papacy as a secular power
    - b. France and Spain
    - c. Julius II's and Machiavelli's real vice
- F. SECOND PART OF THE PRINCE (374-378)
  - 1. Armed Prophets
    - a. Failure of the Sforza family
    - b. Hunting a valuable skill
    - c. History as a great storehouse
  - 2. Princely Virtue
    - a. Dig at Cicero's *De officiis*

- b. Concern with the political consequences of unchastity
- c. Machiavelli's version of original sin
- d. Need for discipline by good laws
- 3. The Prince's Virtù
  - a. Reflections on qualities that make for political success
    - 1) Prince: virtù of one man
    - 2) Discourses: virtù of a people
  - b. Political success linked to achieving glory
  - c. Courage of ordinary men requires good leadership and training
  - d. Bold, ambitious princes
- 4. Honesty and Mutual Loyalty
  - a. Opportunism of a new prince
  - b. Hannibal's extreme cruelty
- 5. Freedom Is the Reward for Successfully Constructing a Republic
  - a. Refusal to be victimized
  - b. Sheldon Wolin: **Economy of violence**
  - c. Attraction of power to a prince
- 6. Violence and Treachery as a Currency to Employ Intelligently
  - a. Goal: attainment of glory
  - b. Glory is obtained by the prince
  - c. In a republic, the people are the heroes
  - d. Case of Agathocles
- 7. Characteristics of the Successful Prince
  - a. Appearance of generosity
- G. LIONS AND FOXES AND POLITICAL ETHICS (378-381)
  - 1. The Fox and the Lion
    - a. Cicero
    - b. Machiavelli's rebuttal
    - c. Duplicity of **Alexander VI**
  - 2. Question Whether Anyone Can Act with the Wanted Amoral Verve and Flair
    - a. Ferdinand of Aragon
    - b. Caution is better than rashness
    - c. Need to avoid flatterers
    - d. The remedy
  - 3. Double Peroration
    - a. Striking a balance between caution and rashness
  - 4. Our Ability to control Half of Our Actions
    - a. Fortune as a River
    - b. Men are chronically idle while things are going well
    - c. They fail to take precautions
  - 5. Role of Character
    - a. Julius II
    - b. Fortune is a woman
    - c. Polybius
- H. FROM THE PRINCE TO THE DISCOURSES (381-386)
  - 1. Commentary on Livy
    - a. Both works exhibit the same principles of statecraft
  - 2. Focus on the Creation of a Self-Sustaining Constitutional Order in a Republic
    - a. Model is **Polybius**
    - b. Body politic
    - c. Rome violates the maxim that consigns an ill-conceived state to failure
  - 3. Machiavelli's New Route
    - a. Proper use of historical evidence
    - b. Echo of Thucydides
    - c. Question of Machiavelli's anachronism
  - 4. Detachment from Conventional Moralizing

- a. It Is Not an Inductive Political Science
- b. Cyclical Theory of History
- 5. Polybius's Historical Style
  - a. Wheel of fate turns unpredictably
  - b. Success breeds failure
- 6. Prudential Maxims
  - a. The end must excuse
  - b. Tyrant is the enemy of his people
- 7. Only Autocrats Can Institute or Restore a State
  - a. Foundings and restorations
    - 1) Ordini
    - 2) Germany's Basic Law
- 8. Religion
  - a. Social Cement
  - b. Christianity
  - c. Auguries
- 9. Animus Directed Against the Papacy
  - a. Its corruption and ineptness
- I. THREE FURTHER DOCTRINES (386-389)
  - 1. Uproar (Conflict) in a Republic Is Conducive to Liberty
    - a. Common people must stand up for their rights
    - b. Secession of the plebeians
    - c. Continued class conflict
  - 2. Defense of the Popular Against the Aristocratic Republic
    - a. Rome as an expansive republic
    - b. Venice was designed for longevity
    - c. Defense of Florentine populism against Venetian elitism
      - 1) Danger of the **grandi**
      - 2) Vices of feudal landlords
    - d. Venice's *governo stretto*
    - e. Florence's *governo largo*
    - f. Venice's rich merchants
  - 3. Inevitability of Decay
    - a. Half measures lead to ruin
    - b. Success is self-defeating
  - 4. Prosperity Slackens the Martial Virtues
    - a. Soft living
    - b. Mercenaries
    - c. Wealth management
    - d. Legal plunder and exemptions

## Review

Florentine militia  
*gonfaloniere*  
*virtù*  
 Alexander VI

Piero Soderini  
 Girolamo Savonarola  
 armed and unarmed prophets  
 Polybius

Signoria  
 Cesare Borgia  
 economy of violence  
 grandi