

2014

## Eva Brann: The Music of the Republic Study Guide, 2011-2014

Steven Alan Samson

*Liberty University*, [ssamson@liberty.edu](mailto:ssamson@liberty.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/gov\\_fac\\_pubs](https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/gov_fac_pubs)



Part of the [Political Science Commons](#), and the [Public Affairs, Public Policy and Public Administration Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Samson, Steven Alan, "Eva Brann: The Music of the Republic Study Guide, 2011-2014" (2014). *Faculty Publications and Presentations*. 438.

[https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/gov\\_fac\\_pubs/438](https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/gov_fac_pubs/438)

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Helms School of Government at Scholars Crossing. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications and Presentations by an authorized administrator of Scholars Crossing. For more information, please contact [scholarlycommunications@liberty.edu](mailto:scholarlycommunications@liberty.edu).

**EVA BRANN: THE MUSIC OF THE REPUBLIC  
STUDY GUIDE, 2011-2014  
Steven Alan Samson**

**CHAPTER 3: THE OFFENSE OF SOCRATES: APOLOGY**

**Outline**

- I. FIRST READING INDUCES AN EXALTED FEELING IN FAVOR OF SOCRATES
  - a. Initial Thesis: We hear a philosopher nobly coping with a persecuting populace
  - b. This is a perennial perception
    - 1) **John Stuart Mill**
    - 2) **Alfred North Whitehead**
  - c. Suspicions Raised on Rereading
    - 1) Accusation against the men of Athens
  - d. Speech intensifies in provocation toward the end
    - 1) Socrates' intransigence
    - 2) Dark threats
  - e. An alternative perception that has a lineage of testimony
    - 1) **Jacob Burckhardt**
    - 2) **Friedrich Nietzsche** and George Sorel
    - 3) Alfred Rosenberg
  - f. The speech's grandeur of utterance
    - 1) Xenophon
- II. REASONS FOR YET ANOTHER READING:
  1. Its Unique Place
    - a. It is Socrates' only speech in Plato's writings
    - b. It is the only work in which Plato, the author, reported himself present
    - c. What Socrates said and did in the Apology casts a shadow over the other works
      - 1) All Platonic conversations are colored by Socrates' defense
- III. APOLOGY BELONGS TO A GROUP OF WORKS CONCERNED WITH MORAL EDUCATION
  2. It Almost Belongs to a Distinct Literary Genre
    - a. Trials of Other Political Offenders
      - 1) Letter by **Helmuth James von Moltke** to his wife, Freya, on the fears of the National Socialists ["And in the face of the thoughts of these three solitary men, the mere thoughts, NS is so scared that it wants to exterminate everything that is infected by it. If that isn't a compliment. After this trial . . . we are to be hanged because we thought together. Feisler [the judge] is right, a thousand time right; and if we are to die, I am favour of dying on this issue." *Letters to Freya, 1939-1945*, p. 404].
    - b. Such trials give an acute form to the question of the influence of thought
- IV. COMPARISON WITH THE **TRIAL OF JESUS**
  - 2a. There Is a Long Tradition of Setting These Ordeals Side by Side
    - a. Apparent similarities
      - 1) Implacable opponents: Anytos and Caiaphas
      - 2) Both trials attended by a band of adherents who deny accusations against them
      - 3) Intransigence in refusing to make an effective defense
      - 4) Shocking unwillingness to evade death
        - a) Their deaths only confirm their influence
      - 5) Charges: Irreverence in the case of Socrates, blasphemy in the case of Jesus
    - b. Ultimate incommensurability of the two cases
      - 1) Socrates speaks; Jesus is silent

- 2) Jewish court prejudged the blasphemy charge
- 3) Admission (or confession) and denial before Pilate
- c. Both cases are the consequence of an irruption of powerful claims incompatible with the authority of the community
  - 1) Jesus is represented as fulfilling in his life and death a prophecy and a mission
  - 2) Socrates is depicted as a man unheralded and unordained
- V. COMPARISON WITH THE **TRIAL OF SIR THOMAS MORE**  
[cf. Robert Bolt's *A Man for All Seasons*]
- 2b Harpsfield: "Our Noble, New Christian Socrates"
  - a. Similarities
  - b. Differences
- VI. WAS SOCRATES RIGHTLY CONVICTED AND CONDEMNED TO DEATH?
- 3. A Question of Several Aspects
  - a. Why did the Heliastic court convict Socrates and accept the prosecution's view that this was a capital case?
    - 1) Socrates complicates the case by turning the defense into an offense
    - 2) His accusations against his accusers and fellow citizens might have become evidence of Socrates' bad faith
  - b. A backlash occurred after Socrates' execution
    - 1) Fate of **Meletos** and **Anytos**
  - c. The Socratic issue remains ever-present whenever individual conviction confronts the religious beliefs and moral tradition of those whom they are intent on serving
- VII. QUESTION OF THE SUFFICIENCY OF SOCRATES' DEFENSE
  - a. Xenophon suggests that Socrates was committing suicide by jury: self-euthanasia
  - b. Plato's *Phaedo* rules out suicide
- VIII. CRITICAL REHEARSAL OF SOCRATES' SPEECH
  - a. His mastery of the situation
    - 1) Introduces his own dialectical mode into the cross-examination
  - b. Meletos
    - 1) Socrates does not allow him to answer in the only way he can answer it: the laws
  - c. Attack on the good faith of the accusers
    - 1) "Old slander:" Aristophanes' *The Clouds*
    - 2) Difficulty with this line of argument: Plato's veneration for the playwright
- IX. SOCRATES MAKES UP A SUPPOSITIOUS INDICTMENT: SEARCHING INTO THINGS BELOW AND ABOVE THE EARTH
  - a. The charge of irreverence is supposedly directed at researches he gave up in his youth
    - 1) Evidence of Socrates' continued interest in cosmology
  - b. **Chaerephon** had gotten Apollo's oracle to declare that no man was wiser than Socrates
    - 1) Thus Socrates can claim to have given the god's business the highest priority [But, of course, he sought to prove the god mistaken]
- X. THE REAL CHARGES: CORRUPTING THE YOUNG AND NOT RESPECTING THE CITY'S GODS
  - a. How he meets the actual charge of irreverence: Socrates "does not regard the gods in the customary way"
    - 1) He cannot accept the traditional stories of the gods (Euthyphro)
    - 2) He traps Meletos into thoughtlessly claiming him to be an atheist
  - b. Socrates' defense
    - 1) Ludicrous argument about half-divinities
  - c. Charge of introducing new divinities
    - 1) Socrates' *daimónion*
    - 2) He aggressively dwells on his "divine sign" more in court than anywhere else
- XI. THE CHARGE OF CORRUPTING THE YOUTH OF ATHENS
  - a. His clever use of the "old slander"
    - 1) Everyone knew, however, that Socrates had no "cogitorium" (or thinkery)
    - 2) Socrates was disingenuous in saying that he had no esoteric teachings [The importance of philosophers' esoteric teachings is belabored by Leo Strauss and

- his followers. See *Persecution and the Art of Writing*]
- b. Socrates knows that his accusers are not precise in their knowledge of sophists
    - 1) How Anytos is portrayed in *Meno*
  - c. Socrates says the Sophists “might be wise with a greater than human wisdom”
    - 1) An ironic way of shifting the role of “expert” onto their shoulders
    - 2) A contrast is thus made with the “unwilling wisdom” of Socrates’ ignorance: that he alone knows that he is ignorant
  - d. Socrates imports a **new charge of “teaching”** and does so by **trickery**
    - 1) He then exonerates himself of the “charge”
  - e. But the charges are grounded in **three troubling circumstances**
    - 1) Since he takes no money, he is uncontrollable---he cannot be engaged or dismissed, as one might with a professional
    - 2) He takes no responsibility for the careers of his young associates
    - 3) He examines public men with disingenuous innocence in ways that demonstrate their incompetence [cf. Hans Christian Anderson’s *The Emperor’s New Clothes*]
      - a) The conversations are really interrogations
      - b) These public humiliations appeal to the mimetic desire of his skeptical puppies [who imitate his questioning of “experts”]
  - f. Xenophon records that Anytos voiced this as a grievance. Xenophon quotes Socrates:

“My brief acquaintance with Anytus’ son led me to believe that he was a person of some caliber; therefore, my prediction is that he will not remain in the servile occupation his father arranged for him [that of a tanner, like the father]; but because there is no one of principle to take him in hand, he will succumb to some base motivation and make considerable progress as a degenerate.”

This prediction of his was quite right: the young man became an alcoholic, spent his days as well as his nights drinking, and finally became utterly worthless to his country, his friends and himself. So Anytus, even though dead, has acquired a bad reputation – for bringing up his son badly as well as for his heartlessness. – *Conversations of Socrates*, pp. 48-49.

## XII. THE DEFENSE IS DELIBERATELY SELF-INCRIMINATING

- a. Working definitions of right and wrong in the *Republic*
  - 1) Socrates was both right and wrong since his business could be seen as meddling
- b. The fears of the judges concerned the substance of the city
  - 1) Socrates makes the collapse of traditions a spectacle for the young
  - 2) He never gives a comforting account of his essential loyalty to the city
- c. Socrates’ indictment was judicially correct

## XIII. THE CASE FOR HIS CONVICTION

- a. **Hegel’s** comprehensive view of the affair, from which some points that follow are drawn
- b. The common view that this was a **political trial** does not hold up under scrutiny
  - 1) Socrates’ previous difficulties
  - 2) Anytos was a moderate democrat, not a radical
- c. The description of Socrates as a radical antidemocrat [as by I. F. Stone] is not convincing
  - 1) The regime was a perfect supermarket of constitutions open for discussion
- d. Athens had borne with Socrates for seventy years
  - 1) His two incursions into politics had passed off safely
- e. Evidence in *Crito*
  - 1) Nearly half the jurors refuse to find him guilty [requirement of a supermajority would have led to his exoneration]
- f. Socrates is allowed to speak freely
  - 1) But he abuses this occasion
- g. Anytos’s harsh recommendation
  - 1) Athenian Stranger in the *Statesman*: Laws and ancestral customs must rule in the absence of true statesmanship

- h. The seriousness of the Athenians claim our respect
- XIV. KIERKEGAARD ON THE IRONY OF SOCRATES
- XV. THE FEATURES OF SOCRATES AS A MAN OF NEGATION
- a. His *daimónion*: the uncanny naysayer (or censor) within
    - 1) It is a negative enthusiasm [en-theos-ism = in-dwelling god]
    - 2) His chief teaching is that excellence is knowledge
    - 3) Thus wrong deeds stem from ignorance and are in a deep sense inadvertent [there is no concept of sin here]
    - 4) The *daimónion* is Socrates' ability to avoid wrong, his negative excellence
    - 5) It makes him refrain from engaging in politics
  - b. Socrates claims to be the only one who engages in true (but negative) politics
    - 1) Here he differs from Sir Thomas More
- XVI. THE GREATEST GOOD FOR MAN IS FORMULATED IN NEGATIVE TERMS
- a. The unexamined life is not livable for a man
  - b. The first culmination of Socrates' non-didactic teaching: *aporía* = waylessness
    - 1) Seen in terms of a public service, Socrates' is a negative teacher
  - c. Philosophic activity is presented as an entirely negative effort
    - 1) His ultimate negative wisdom is his knowledge of his ignorance of Hades
- XVII. PLATO WRITES A SECOND DEFENSE OF SOCRATES IN PRISON
- a. The *Crito*
    - 1) Socrates permits the laws to upbraid him
  - b. The *Phaedo*
    - 1) Dialogue on Death
    - 2) Socrates here presents himself as the one and only knower
    - 3) He makes philosophical matters clear. Echecrates remarks: "It seems to me that Socrates made his meaning extraordinarily clear to even a limited intelligence."
    - 4) All of Socrates' great notions are recapitulated: the presupposition of Ideas (*eidé*), invisible forms, myth of recollection, the true good
    - 5) Philosophy as an inquiry into the realm of death, the **invisible Hades** (*Aídes aeidés*, which is discussed in *Cratylus*)
    - 6) Death is Socrates' immigration to the realm of Being [cf. Socrates' symbolic voyage to Hades in the *Republic*]
- THE CONCLUSION**
- XVIII. WHY DOES SOCRATES GO ON THE OFFENSIVE?
- a. Socrates becomes a resister, the defender of philosophy from the city's attack
    - 1) He has the **spiritedness** (*thymos*) of his hero Achilles
  - b. Socrates's conduct must have been an accommodation to the conditions of the occasion
    - 1) Lack of time for quiet persuasion through leisurely direct conversation with its accompanying inner dialogue
    - 2) His "positive wisdom stated concisely in public would appear simply bizarre"
  - c. Refutation of a false opinion is meant to be followed by the search for truth
    - 1) But in a public setting, the conversation is curtailed and the transformation [*i.e.*, convincing the other] will not take place. Socrates complains of the lack of time to persuade. [NOTE: The rhetoric of debate is meant to persuade an audience, not the other side in the debate]
    - 2) When philosophy comes upon the city, it comes as a negation and a threat
- XIX. PLATO SPEAKS, OFFERING A SOBER AND SENSIBLE MONEY PENALTY
- a. Its effect is to subvert Socrates' own proud and derisory proposals
    - 1) It is like a rebuke of Socrates
  - b. What Plato has heard in court is that Socrates' activity is **publicly indefensible**
- XX. CONCLUDING CONJECTURE
- a. There was a danger that the life of the Socratic conversations would pass into oblivion
    - 1) And that the positive content of his wisdom would shrivel into conformity with his successors' (such as Aristotle's) more technical systems [Indeed, Aristotle left the Academy after Plato's death over disagreements with the direction it took]
  - b. But his heroic intransigence would reestablish him, thus establishing the Socrates of



- 5) Historical context and economic conditions may be beside the point
5. Biographical Facts
  - a. Socrates' trial
  - b. Plato's brothers
    - 1) Plato's *Seventh Letter*
    - 2) Execution of Socrates
    - 3) Failure of the philosophical education of Dionysius
6. Plato's *Laws*
  - a. A second sailing
  - b. A day's walk under the Cretan sun
7. Introductory Interpretations
  - a. The dialogue is a carefully guided discussion
  - b. Its structure is revealing
  - c. Pregnant omissions: The full-scale inquiry into the parts of the soul is withheld
- B. THE CENTRAL DIALOGUE: THE PHILOSOPHER'S CITY (93-97)
  1. Its Architectural Symmetry
  2. **Concentric Circles** [cf. chiasmic structures in literature; seating rows in an amphitheater]
    - a. Repetition of major themes going in and coming out
    - b. Critique of poetry
  3. Dialectical Center
    - a. **Méthodos**
      - 1) Education into a view of the Whole
  4. Center: Politics is replaced by philosophy
    - a. **Rousseau's *Émile*** is meant to be the individualistic modern replacement
    - b. Socrates transforms a political question into an educational one
      - 1) Issue of the compatibility of justice with happiness is thrust aside
      - 2) The doing of **justice** is not a source of happiness but a simple sacrifice
      - 3) Justice demands that we descend (**katében**) from the realm of Being into the realm of appearance
  5. Why the Transformation of Politics into Pedagogy Is Necessitated
    - a. The **founding paradox** of the ideal city
      - 1) The ideal city requires that kings be philosophers
      - 2) But this would be a wrenching conversion for a king [cf. the **Cave Image**]
      - 3) Novel conditions are required for a philosopher to become a king
      - 4) Comic counsel of despair: It can only come about if a native philosopher happens to come into power, exiles the adults, and seizes command of their children's education [cf. Khmer Rouge, Progressive education]
    - b. Resolution of the paradox of circularity
      - 1) Socrates' and Glaucon's last exchange on the philosopher city
      - 2) It is a model laid up in heaven to found oneself (592b)
    - c. The point of the *Republic* is a personal founding, a self-constitution
      - 1) This is how Socrates bypasses the founders paradox
      - 2) It requires development of an educational community in speech
      - 3) Thus Socrates educates his interlocutors "in deed"
      - 4) This is *the* Socratic accomplishment, not the preparation of future **philosopher-kings**
  6. The End of Culmination of the Curriculum
    - a. It is not an advance in subject matter but an ascent to the Good
      - 1) This is the governing source: the source (*arché*) of the Whole
    - b. The **Sun Simile**: Likeness of the Good
      - 1) It gives Being to the forms
      - 2) It gives illumination to appearances
- C. THE DIVIDED LINE (97-101)
  1. Cosmos of Substance and Shadows: Being and Appearance
    - a. Four realms: Intelligibles, mathematics, natural objects, reflections [see p. 220]
  2. Four Appropriate Powers of the Soul: Correspondences or Correlations

- a. Chief passions and their controlling excellences correspond to different parts of the soul: reason, will, and appetite
- b. Different political regimes correspond to different human types: aristocracy, timocracy, oligarchy, democracy, tyranny
- c. Different objects of knowledge correspond to different powers of knowledge: knowledge, opinion, ignorance
- 3. Where Socrates usually begins: Knowledge vs. opinions
  - a. The central section gives us a preview of the ascending and descending realms of Being
- 4. Brann Reverses Socrates' Order in Her Interpretation, Begins with the Highest Segment
  - a. **Nóesis** = Intellection
    - 1) Dialectic
    - 2) **Eídos = Form**; it is an intelligible being, the thing itself [*ding an sich*]
  - b. **Diánoia** = Understanding
    - 1) It works through pure non-sensory images; its business is to make assumptions or hypotheses
  - c. Together, these two upper parts of the line represent the realm of Knowledge: **Epístème**
- 5. The Two Lower Parts Represent **Dóxa** = Opinion
  - a. The third segment is coextensive with the second and stands for **Pístis** = Trust
    - 1) We take for granted the apparently solid things in the world around us
    - 2) In *Timaeus*, Socrates is invited to a feast of cosmos construction
  - b. **Eikasía** = Imaging
    - 1) Power of image recognition
    - 2) Recognizing likenesses as likenesses
- 6. A Number of Dialogues Show an Overwhelming Interest in the Nature of Images and Their Seeming (Appearances)
  - a. The image which is not what it seems is a prime exemplar of the realm between **Being and Nonbeing**
    - 1) This is the shifting shadow world of mutability that is called **Becoming**
  - b. Censoring such products of the imagination, Music, has scandalized readers
    - 1) But Socrates is dead serious about the **potency of poetry** [and René Girard's theory of mimetic desire supports his view]
    - 2) The danger comes from the corruption of the primary power of **philosophical ascent**: image recognition [cf. Girard's mimetic desire]
- D. THE CAVE IMAGE (101)
  - 1. Socrates Describes the Human Costs and Effort of Making This Ascent
    - a. He begins with an invitation to use this power of image recognition
      - 1) The shadow plays are mere images of images [cf. television; this is a theme of the Truman Show]
      - 2) Blinding sun of the Sun Simile
      - 3) Being dragged back down into the cave [*katében* theme]
- E. THE PHILOSOPHER'S EDUCATION (102-03)
  - 1. Curriculum Described as a Winch to Lift the Soul from Becoming to Being
    - a. It picks up where gymnastics and music leave off
    - b. Liberal arts
      - 1) Quadrivium [which combined with trivium complete the seven liberal arts]
  - 2. Mathematics
  - 3. **Dialectic**
    - a. Reflection (inner dialogue) and conversation (outer dialogue)
  - 4. Exclusion from the Curriculum of All Political Theory and All Science of Government
    - a. It is an education more for philosophers than statesmen
    - b. If philosophers were destined to govern, it would be in the light of the Whole
      - 1) Action would not be rule-ridden but adjusted to each case [cf. common law]
      - 2) Not a neutral oneness but only through the Good can the world be the



- scene of justice [argument against merely political global governance]
- E. THE OUTER DIALOGUE: THE DEGENERATE CITIES (103-04)
1. The Just City “in Speech”
    - a. A series of **cities-in-speech** is built up
    - b. Their degeneration is pursued through symmetrically similar stages
      - 1) Each degenerative stage is a commonly recognized real regime
  2. By Contrast, the Patterns Leading to the **Philosopher City** Begin with the Craftsman City
    - a. The highest and happiest city is a **dialogic community** [like the *Republic*]
      - 1) It is a league of learning
    - b. Tyranny is truly private(d), deprived
  3. **Guardian City**
    - a. This “city-in-speech” has created the greatest scandal
    - b. Mitigating factors
      - 1) The city is Unitarian rather than totalitarian
      - 2) It is only the ruling group itself that lives under the harshest communal Discipline
- F. JUSTICE IN SOCRATES’ CITY (104-06)
1. This City Is Only Built Up for the Sake of Argument
    - a. It is literally a **utopia** (no-place)
    - b. Purpose: To project justice on the largest possible screen [cf. the shadows in the Cave Image]
  2. The Preliminary Argument about Justice Takes Place in Book One
    - a. Justice might have to be primarily a matter of internal soundness
  3. A Hypothesis about the Nature of Justice Must Be Built into a Constitution in Order for It to Display Justice
    - a. Socrates’ presupposition: Justice is an excellence concerned with self-relation, not a condition or procedure
      - 1) It is “to do one’s own thing” (one’s own business) [division of labor]
      - 2) As opposed to a “do all”: **panóurgos**
  4. The Just City
    - a. It is an aristocracy [in Edmund Burke’s sense of “natural aristocracy”]
    - b. It is a thoroughly articulated community with everyone in an appropriate niche [cf. 1 Cor. 12:14-31]
    - c. Justice thus belongs to the whole community
  5. The Just Soul
    - a. A well-adjusted soul whose external relations are a reflection of its inner order
  6. Justice as Doing One’s Own Business
    - a. To be just is to be good on one’s own and good for others
- G. THE FINAL MYTH (106-07)
1. Socrates’ Dialectic Dominates the First Book
  2. The Last Book Concludes with a Socratic Myth
  3. **Myth of Er**
    - a. Myth is meant to foster the conviction that the process of living has behind it a controlling form
    - b. The moment for another choice [of souls; cf. conversion] cannot fail to come

## Review

concentric circles	<i>méthodos</i>	Rousseau’s <i>Émile</i>
justice	<i>katében</i> [I went down]	founding paradox
Cave Image	philosopher king	Sun Simile
<i>Nóesis</i>	<i>Eídos</i> = Form	<i>Diánoia</i>
<i>Epistéme</i>	<i>Dóxa</i> = Opinion	<i>Pístis</i> = Trust
<i>Eikasía</i> = Imaging	Being and Nonbeing	Becoming
potency of poetry	philosophical ascent	dialectic
cities-in-speech	Philosopher City	dialogic community

## CHAPTER SIX: THE MUSIC OF THE *REPUBLIC*

### SURVEY OF THE ARGUMENTS

#### Outline

#### I. MÝTHOS

- A. *REPUBLIC* IS COMPOSED OF CONCENTRIC RINGS ENCOMPASSING A CENTER (116)  
[cf. A Greek amphitheater and Chiasmic Structures in Literature]
  1. **Érgon**: The Deed (The City-in-Deed) or Accomplishment Is Placed at the Center
  2. **Outermost Periphery** of the Concentric Rings: A Setting of **Myth**
  3. **Broad Inner Ring** Consists of the Construction and Destruction of the Successive Forms of a Pattern City-in-Speech
  4. The **Center** Presents the Actual Founding of a City-in-Deed
- B. OUTER RING REPRESENTS SOCRATES' DESCENT INTO THE HOUSE OF THE DEAD (116-18)
  1. Anecdote of Diogenes Laertius and Dionysius of Halicarnassus
    - a. Opening line: **katében** (I went down)
  2. Piraeus
    - a. Omission of the article "the" suggests its original meaning: Beyond-land
    - b. Land beyond the river [This suggests the mythical river Styx]
  3. Bendis [Hecate]: Guardian deity of the underworld
  4. **Cephalus** ["Head"] Sits in State
    - a. He is on the threshold of Hades
    - b. Reduced to a mere head, he sits on a head-rest
    - c. His wealth (*plóutos* as in plutocracy) is his great comfort
  5. **Setting**: We Are in the City of Shades, in the House of Pluto [underworld god]
- 1
- C. APPEAL TO HERMES, THE CONDUCTOR OF SOULS (118-19)
  1. Socrates' Oath: "By the Dog!"
    - a. Egyptian dog-god
      - 1) Egyptian name is Anubis; Greek name is Hermes
      - 2) He is a *psychagogue*: A conductor of souls and a guide to those who must descend into Hades while yet alive [cf. Homer's *Odyssey* and Dante's *Inferno*]
  2. Hermes: Guide of the Hero Heracles (Hercules)
- 2
- D. SOCRATES ASSUMES THE ROLE OF HERACLES: CHIEF FOUNDER OF CITIES (119-21)
  1. Heracles: The Great Civilizer Who Is Proficient at Music
    - a. He is the guardian of the education of boys at the *palaestra*
      - 1) Boys devote cuttings of their hair to him
    - b. He teaches men letters
    - c. He is the partisan of Virtue for the sake of the *eudaimonía* she promised
    - d. His labors were imposed the unjust king Eurystheus
      - 1) *Katábasis* (descent) into Hades
      - 2) Cerberus: tripe monster
      - 3) Release of Theseus, the founder of Athens
      - 4) Failure to release Pirithous
  2. Socrates Makes the Comparison with Heracles

- a. Allusion to the labors of Heracles in the *Apology*
  - b. “ “ “ in *Phaedo*
  - c. “ “ “ in the *Republic*
- 1) Comparison with Odysseus, who meets the phantom Heracles in Hades
  - 2) Socrates fights with the sophist Thrasymachus, who attacks like a beast  
[Error: The reference to (377 a 4) should read (337 a 4)]

3-4

## E. ENACTING A MYTH (IN DEED): SOCRATES' LONGEST AND GREATEST LABORS (121-22)

- 1. Relation of Virtue to Happiness
  - a. **Ring of Gyges**
  - b. Helmet of Hades
- 2. Challenges (Labors)
  - a. Use of the great text of the city to teach the small text of the soul
  - b. Threat of drowning
  - c. Release of Theseus/Glaucon through soul-conducting music
  - d. Dragging to the light of the triple monster/soul to cleanse it of its accretions
    - 1) This completes the argument in defense of unrewarded justice [Ryan's *On Politics*, p. 69, disagrees]

## II. LÓGOS

A

## F. THE SECOND RING REPRESENTS THE FOUNDING AND DEGENERATION OF CITIES-IN-SPEECH (122-24)

- 1. Bringing to Light the Constitution of the Soul
  - a. Method: Raising and taking down cities-in-speech (*logoi*)
- 2. Invitation to Make a City from the Beginning -- in Argument
  - a. Community of craftsmen (collection of workers)
    - 1) *Demiogoi*: public workers
    - 2) Most literal model for justice
    - 3) Glaucon rejects it as a city of pigs
    - 4) Socrates gives up his healthy city
    - 5) Reorganization
  - b. Luxurious or fevered city (by addition)
    - 1) Examination of how justice and injustice grow up in cities
    - 2) natures and training of soldiers (guardians)
    - 3) Reorganization
  - c. Guardian city: A tripartite city (division)
  - d. Fourth city: Books 5-7
- 3. Four Degenerate Cities

B

## G. THESE CITIES ARE IN SPEECH ONLY BECAUSE THEY CANNOT BE GENERATED OR REGENERATED (124-26)

- 1. No Actual City of Living Men Comes into Being as They Speak
  - a. Word constructions are not constitutions
    - 1) They are not meant to be models
    - 2) No human being is native or born into any of these cities
- 2. Adults of Each of the Three Cities Are of All of One and the Same Generation; the Institution of Each City Is Simply the Rearrangement of Ready-Made Human Material
  - a. The third city begins with the separate encampment of the guardians
    - 1) This is followed by the expulsion of all souls over ten years
    - 2) Two irreconcilable geneses of the just city
    - 3) City of children
- 3. Noble Lie
  - a. Phoenician myth
  - b. City of the earthborn (autochthonous)
    - 1) Brothers with a common mother

- c. Old patriotic theme that denotes their equality
- 4. Nature of the Lie
  - a. They are by implication fatherless
- 5. The First Natural Birth Will Refute the Foundations of the Lie

2

H. COMMUNITY OF WOMEN AND CHILDREN